

# THE SIGNATURE OF EVIL

## (Re)Defining Torture in International Law

Steven DEWULF



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

# CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i> .....	v
<i>Foreword</i> .....	vii
<i>List of frequently used abbreviations</i> .....	xvii

Introduction. Origin, Object, Methodological and Structural Design of the Treatise .....	1
---	---

Prelude – Freedom Wars and Torture’s (Re)Turn .....	3
---	---

Chapter I. Object of the Study .....	9
--------------------------------------	---

Section 1. Origin and Delimitation of the Subject Matter .....	9
--	---

Section 2. Elusive ‘Torture’? Defining the Legal Concept .....	10
--	----

Section 3. ... and then Redefining the Notion of Torture .....	13
--	----

Section 4. Torture and Other Brutalities .....	15
--	----

Section 5. The Context .....	16
------------------------------	----

Chapter II. Framework and Working Method .....	19
--	----

Section 1. The Framework of International Law .....	19
---	----

Section 2. The Working Method .....	23
-------------------------------------	----

1. Beyond Law .....	23
---------------------	----

2. Beyond Theory .....	24
------------------------	----

Chapter III. Structure of the Study .....	27
---	----

## Part I

Defining Torture: Deconstructing the Notion into its Basic Components ....	29
--	----

Preface .....	31
---------------	----

Section 1. A Legal Concept .....	32
----------------------------------	----

Section 2. Contemporary .....	34
-------------------------------	----

Section 3. Structural Approach .....	36
--------------------------------------	----

Chapter I. Contemporary Legal Sources on Torture .....	37
--	----

Section 1. The Many Faces of Torture .....	39
--	----

1. Illegality v. Criminality: International Human Rights Law, International Humanitarian Law and International Criminal Law.	39
---	----

2. Defining Torture Differently? .....	44
--	----

Section 2. Torture’s Codifications .....	46
--	----

Section 3. Causes of, and Problems Relating to, the Absence of a Definition .....	51
1. Causes .....	51
2. Problems .....	55
2.1. The Principle of Legality .....	56
2.2. Torture v. other Forms of Ill-treatment .....	60
Chapter II. Defining Torture: the Basic Elements .....	69
Section 1. Definitions in International Law .....	69
Section 2. International Jurisprudence and Other Sources .....	72
Section 3. The Basic Elements .....	80
1. Severe Physical or Mental Pain or Suffering .....	82
1.1. 'Severe' v. 'Serious et al.'? .....	89
1.2. Determining the Severity of the Inflicted Pain or Suffering ...	98
1.2.1. Pain or Suffering .....	99
1.2.1.1. Views on Pain from the Medical World ....	100
1.2.1.2. Categories of Pain .....	103
1.2.1.3. Pain v. Suffering (?) .....	104
1.2.2. Lawful Practices Entailing a Certain Degree of Pain or Suffering .....	105
1.2.2.1. From Torture to Human Dignity .....	106
1.2.2.2. Legal Punishments .....	112
1.2.2.3. The Legitimate Use of Force .....	116
A. The Contextual Element – Part I .....	117
B. The Conduct and Persona of the Alleged Victim .....	119
1.2.3. 'Cultural Relativism' .....	124
1.2.3.1. Human Rights and Cultural Elements .....	128
1.2.3.2. The Prohibition of Maltreatment and Cultural Elements .....	132
1.2.4. The Evolving Nature of Torture and Other Ill-treatment .....	136
1.2.4.1. The 'Five Techniques' Then and Now .....	137
1.2.4.2. Determining the Evolution .....	141
1.2.5. The Threshold of Pain or Suffering .....	145
1.2.5.1. A Case-By-Case Approach .....	145
A. Subjective and Objective Factors .....	147
B. The Fluctuating Importance of Different Elements within the Global Evaluation ..	149
C. The Contextual Element – Part II .....	150
1.2.5.2. No Catalogue of 'Torturous' Techniques ...	152
A. From the Rack to the Screw .....	153
B. Contemporary Instruments of Torment. ....	157

C. Torturous Acts and Torturous Situations .....	159
D. Acts, but of Torture? .....	161
1.2.5.3. Acts and Omissions of Physical Torture .....	161
A. From Falanga to Appalling Prison Conditions .....	161
B. Enhanced Interrogation Techniques, Torture Lite and the Waterboard .....	170
1.2.5.4. Mental Torture .....	178
A. Psychological Torture Techniques .....	180
B. Psychological Warfare in the 'War on Terror' .....	186
1.2.5.5. The Blurred Line between Physical and Mental Agony .....	188
1.2.5.6. No Lasting Marks of Torture Necessary ...	190
1.3. Relative Severity as Decisive Element (?) .....	194
1.3.1. A More Absolute Yardstick? .....	194
1.3.2. The Intensity of the Pain or Suffering as Core Feature? .....	196
1.3.2.1. From Extreme to (Relative) Severity .....	196
1.3.2.2. The Intensity of Pain and Suffering and Other Constituent Elements .....	199
1.3.3. The IACPPT Leads the Way? .....	204
1.3.3.1. Obliteration and Diminishment of Abilities as a Purpose? .....	204
1.3.3.2. Beyond Pain and Suffering: Torture and (Pseudo)Science .....	205
2. Act or Omission .....	212
3. Intent .....	214
3.1. Torturous Intent: From Direct Intent to...? .....	217
3.2. The Perpetrator's State of Mind: There is a Torturer in All of Us .....	225
3.3. Mens Rea of other Brutal Treatments and Punishments .....	229
3.4. Intent and Purpose .....	233
4. Specific Purpose .....	233
4.1. Domination: the Establishment of Control and the Creation of Power .....	240
4.1.1. A Primary Purpose .....	240
4.1.2. A Secondary Purpose? .....	241
4.2. Obtaining Information from the Victim or a Third Person ..	242
4.2.1. Judicial Torture throughout the Ages .....	244
4.2.2. Gathering Information at the Present Day .....	251
4.3. Obtaining a Confession from the Victim or a Third Person ..	255

4.4. Punishment for an Act the Victim or a Third Person Has Committed or Is Suspected of Having Committed .....	258
4.4.1. Punitive Torture and other Cruel, Inhuman and Degrading Punishments .....	259
4.4.2. A Brief Historical Account of Punitive Torture. ....	262
4.4.3. Torturous Punishments and Modern Times .....	267
4.4.3.1. Imprisonment and Solitary Confinement ..	268
4.4.3.2. Corporal Punishments .....	274
4.4.3.3. The Death Penalty .....	279
A. Circumstances Relating to the Imposition and Execution of the Death Penalty.....	280
B. The Death Penalty as Forbidden Ill-treatment Per Se?.....	291
4.5. Intimidating the Victim or a Third Person .....	300
4.5.1. Intimidation and Coercion .....	302
4.5.2. A Tool of Political Oppression .....	303
4.6. Coercing the Victim or a Third Person.....	304
4.7. For Any Reason Based on Discrimination of Any Kind .....	308
4.8. Other Purposes? .....	311
4.8.1. For Purposes of a Criminal Investigation.....	313
4.8.2. As a Preventive Measure .....	316
4.8.3. Humiliating and Degrading the Victim or a Third person.....	317
4.8.4. Medical Purposes .....	320
4.8.4.1. Torture in the Medical Sphere .....	320
4.8.4.2. Medical, Biological and Scientific Experimentation.....	325
4.8.5. Educational Purposes.....	328
4.8.6. Religious, Cultural and/or Traditional Reasons and Purposes.....	331
4.8.7. Economic Purposes .....	338
4.8.8. Revenge.....	344
4.8.9. Rage and Hate.....	346
4.8.10. Sadistic Pleasure .....	347
4.8.10.1. Pleasure in General .....	349
4.8.10.2. Sexual Gratification for the Victim? .....	351
4.8.11. No Purpose at All? .....	351
4.8.11.1. Gratuitous Torture and International Law..	352
4.8.11.2. Gratuitous Torture and National Law.....	355
4.9. What Specific Intent for the Future?.....	358
5. The Perpetrator .....	363

5.1. The 'Public Official-Requirement' .....	363
5.1.1. The Principle .....	363
5.1.2. The Scope .....	364
5.1.2.1. The 'Public Official' .....	364
5.1.2.2. ... As (In)direct Perpetrator or Otherwise ..	366
5.1.2.3. ... Within or Outside its Sphere of Competence .....	369
5.1.2.4. ... Acting as Part of de iure or de facto Authorities.....	369
5.1.3. The Origin .....	370
5.1.3.1. Official Torture as (Sole) Fixation of the UNCAT .....	370
5.1.3.2. Torture as State Business and the Conceptualisation of International Law .....	372
5.1.3.3. Dissenting Opinions in (Inter)national Law (?) .....	373
5.1.4. International Humanitarian and Criminal Law Sensu Stricto .....	376
5.1.5. Human Rights Law? .....	381
5.1.5.1. The Structural Context and Conceptualisation of Human Rights Law ..	381
5.1.5.2. Human Rights Law and Non-State Actors..	381
A. Non-Refoulement: Expulsion, Extradition and other forms of Deportation .....	382
B. Positive Obligations, <i>Drittwirkung</i> & Human Rights Courts and Bodies.....	385
5.1.5.3. Domestic Violence & Private Torture.....	389
5.1.6. An Issue of Imputability and Accountability.....	398
5.2. A Natural Person .....	400
5.2.1. Torture and State Responsibility .....	400
5.2.2. Participation to the Crime of Torture.....	401
5.2.3. Legal Persons.....	402
5.2.3.1. Accountability for Human Rights Violations.....	403
5.2.3.2. Responsibility in International Criminal Law .....	407
6. The Victim .....	409
6.1. A Human Victim .....	409
6.2. Direct and Indirect Victims.....	411
6.2.1. Direct Victims.....	411
6.2.2. Indirect Victims .....	413

6.2.2.1. Ill-treatment Following or Preventing a Torture Complaint .....	413
6.2.2.2. Enforced Disappearances .....	415
A. <i>Incommunicado</i> and/or Secret Detention and Ill-treatment of the Direct Victim ..	418
B. Suffering of the Next of Kin .....	422
C. Torture of the Next of Kin .....	427
6.2.2.3. Torture's Tentacles .....	428
6.3. The Prototypical Torture Victim .....	430
6.4. Control, Powerlessness and Destruction of Humanity .....	434
6.4.1. A Situation of Control .....	434
6.4.2. Powerlessness of the Victim .....	439
6.4.3. Breaking the Will and Submission of the Victim .....	442
6.4.4. Debasement of the Victim and Destruction of Humanity .....	444
6.5. Reflections on the Essential Nature of Powerlessness and Control .....	445
Chapter III. Provisional Conclusion .....	449
Part II	
Redefining Torture: Towards a Relative Interpretation .....	453
Preface .....	455
Chapter I. Guiding Principles .....	457
Section 1. Absolutism and Non-Derogability .....	457
Section 2. Universality .....	460
Section 3. Flexibility .....	461
Section 4. Uniformity .....	462
Section 5. The Uniqueness and Stigma of Torture .....	464
1. Retaining the Unique Character of Torture .....	465
2. Torture as the Epitome of Cruelty .....	469
Section 6. Conformity with Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms .....	471
Section 7. Torture as a Multilayered Concept and Relativism .....	475
Chapter II. The Essential Elements .....	477
Section I. The Element that Should Not Be Retained .....	477
1. The 'Public Official-Requirement': International Human Rights Law Following International Humanitarian and Criminal Law <i>Sensu Stricto</i> ? .....	477
1.1. The Definition in Article 1 UNCAT and General Human Rights Law .....	478
1.2. Deleting the Public Official-Requirement in International Human Rights Law .....	481

1.2.1. The Definition of Torture as a Human Rights Notion .....	481
1.2.2. The Issue of International Accountability for Private Torture .....	484
1.2.2.1. State Obligations in Combating Private Torture .....	484
A. Positive Obligations of States in Light of the Prohibition of Torture .....	485
B. Positive Obligations with Regard to Private Torture .....	487
1.2.2.2. International Responsibility .....	490
1.2.2.3. The Act of Torture and the Violation of the Human Right .....	492
1.2.2.4. Private Individuals and Entities as Duty Bearers under International Human Rights Law? .....	493
2. General Conclusion, Limits and Qualifications .....	495
2.1. No State Responsibility Per Se .....	496
2.2. There Has to Be at least One Perpetrator .....	497
2.3. Official Torture Should Be Recognised as an Aggravated Form .....	499
Section 2. Elements which Are Retained and Given an Absolute Interpretation .....	500
1. A Perpetrator and a Direct Victim .....	500
2. Conduct .....	500
3. Intent .....	501
Section 3. Elements which Should Be Retained and Given a Relative Interpretation .....	503
1. Physical or Mental Pain or Suffering .....	503
1.1. Level(s) of Intensity .....	504
1.2. A More Transparent Measuring Tool .....	508
2. Specific Intent .....	515
2.1. Purposes and Motivations That Are Insufficient .....	517
2.2. Purposes and Motivations of the Torturer and Their Classification .....	521
2.2.1. Specific Intent of the First Degree .....	521
2.2.2. Specific Intent of the Second Degree .....	522
2.2.3. Specific Intent of the Third Degree .....	525
3. Status of the Victim .....	526
Section 4. The Contextual Element – Part III .....	532
Chapter III. A Theory of Communicating Vessels .....	535
Section 1. Confessional Torture .....	537

Section 2. Interrogational Torture.....	540
Section 3. Coercive Torture.....	542
Section 4. Intimidatory Torture.....	544
Section 5. Experimental Torture.....	545
Section 6. Punitive Torture.....	546
Section 7. Discriminatory Torture.....	547
Section 8. Sadistic Torture.....	549
Section 9. Multiple Purposes and/or Motivations.....	549
Chapter IV. A Redefinition.....	551
Concluding Reflections.....	553
<i>Annexes</i> .....	561
<i>Annex I. List of Jurisprudence</i> .....	561
<i>Annex II. Reports et al.</i> .....	585
<i>Annex III. Bibliography.</i> .....	601