

THE PLACE OF RELIGION
IN FAMILY LAW:
A COMPARATIVE SEARCH

Edited by

Jane MAIR
Esin ÖRÜCÜ



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	v	
<i>List of authors</i>	vii	
 <i>INTRODUCTORY OVERVIEW</i>		
 <i>INTRODUCTION TO THE PLACE OF RELIGION IN FAMILY LAW: A COMPARATIVE SEARCH</i>		
Esin ÖRÜCÜ	3	
 <i>PART ONE</i>		
<i>ACCOMMODATING A PLACE FOR RELIGION?</i>		13
 <i>ISLAMIC LAW IN BRITISH COURTS: DO WE NOT KNOW OR DO WE NOT WANT TO KNOW?</i>		
Werner MENSKI	15	
1. Introduction	15	
2. The core issue: barriers for knowledge	19	
3. Methodological barriers	26	
4. Three case studies	29	
4.1. The adoption case of little Anas	30	
4.2. Ahmadi marriages in Pakistan	31	
4.3. Muslim divorce cases from Pakistan and Bangladesh	33	
5. Conclusions	34	
 <i>THE PLACE OF RELIGION IN FAMILY LAW: THE INTERNATIONAL PRIVATE LAW IMPERATIVE</i>		
Elizabeth B. CRAWFORD and Janeen M. CARRUTHERS	37	
1. Introduction	37	
2. Marriage	38	
2.1. Polygamy	38	
2.2. Legal capacity to marry	42	

3.	Extra-judicial divorces and annulments.....	47
3.1.	Background	47
3.2.	Recognition of overseas divorces and annulments	48
3.2.1.	EU divorce, legal separation or marriage annulment.....	49
3.2.2.	Non-EU divorce, legal separation or marriage annulment ..	49
3.3.	Transnational divorces.....	52
3.4.	Family Law (Scotland) Act 2006, section 15.....	55
4.	Choice of law in nullity	56
4.1.	A statutory response.....	61
4.2.	Forced Marriage etc. (Protection and Jurisdiction) (Scotland) Act	62
5.	Children	64
6.	Conclusion.....	68

PART TWO

<i>DENYING A PLACE FOR RELIGION?</i>	71
--	----

THE LEGAL SCOPE FOR RELIGIOUS IDENTITY IN FAMILY
MATTERS – THE PARADOXES OF THE SWEDISH APPROACH

Maarit JÄNTERÄ-JAREBORG	73
-------------------------------	----

1.	Introduction	73
1.1.	The myth of Sweden as “the most secular country in the world” ...	73
1.2.	Demarcations.....	75
2.	Religious affinity in Sweden – statistics and explanations.....	76
2.1.	The dominance of the Church of Sweden	76
2.2.	“The Swedish paradoxes”	77
2.2.1.	High Church membership without active participation ...	77
2.2.2.	The impact of secularisation on society and religion	79
2.3.	The new presence of Islam in Sweden	80
3.	Marriage and religion	82
3.1.	Various stages of development	82
3.2.	Marriage conclusion.....	84
3.2.1.	The 1734 Marriage Code: obligatory religious ceremony....	84
3.2.2.	A united Nordic approach – freedom of choice between ceremonies.....	85
3.2.3.	The present situation and challenges of multicultural.....	85
3.2.4.	The tension of same-sex marriages	88
4.	Divorce and religion.....	90
4.1.	Divorce under the 1734 Marriage Code	90
4.2.	A united Nordic approach to divorce	90
4.3.	The present situation.....	92
4.4.	Divorce and multicultural.....	93

5.	The “paradoxes” – a summary of the inter-relation between family law and religion in Sweden	95
----	--	----

FAMILY LAW AND RELIGION: THE RUSSIAN PERSPECTIVE,
PAST AND PRESENT

Masha ANTOKOLSKAIA.....	97
-------------------------	----

1.	Introduction	97
2.	The period of religious family law	97
2.1.	Middle Ages: the period of pure religious family law	98
2.2.	New times: religious family law with some secular flavour	101
2.2.1.	Reforms of Peter the Great	101
2.2.2.	Russia “misses the train” of Enlightenment.....	104
3.	The period of secular family law in the militant atheistic environment .	105
3.1.	Radical break with religious law.....	105
3.2.	Radical reforms of family law as an example of successful social engineering.....	108
3.3.	Evaluation of reforms: “excesses of the revolutionary period” or paving the way to the future?	109
3.4.	Stalin’s counter reform.....	111
3.5.	From Stalin to perestroika.....	112
4.	The period of secular family law in a religion-friendly environment ...	113
5.	Concluding remarks.....	115

HOW FAR CAN RELIGION BE ACCOMMODATED IN THE LAIC
FAMILY LAW OF TURKEY?

Esin ÖRÜCÜ	117
------------------	-----

1.	Introductory overview.....	117
2.	Turkish laicism and family law	122
2.1.	Turkish laicism	122
2.2.	Family law	127
2.2.1.	Religious marriages	129
2.2.2.	Children	135
2.2.2.1.	The problem of legitimacy of children born into religious marriages.....	135
2.2.2.2.	Religious instruction	138
2.2.3.	Adultery.....	139
2.2.4.	The position of the wife as an equal spouse	142
2.2.4.1.	The wife-as-guarantor	142
2.2.4.2.	The woman’s surname	144
2.2.4.3.	The wife’s right to work	145
3.	Family law in the early years of the Turkish Republic	146

4. Family law in the later years of the Turkish Republic. 148
5. Concluding remarks. 152

PART THREE

- SUPPORTING A PLACE FOR RELIGION?* 159

RELIGION AND FAMILY LAW IN IRELAND: FROM A CATHOLIC PROTECTION OF MARRIAGE TO A "CATHOLIC" APPROACH TO NULLITY

Maebh HARDING 161

1. Introduction 161
2. Pre 1937: two separate functioning systems. 162
3. The Irish constitutional protection of marriage: a protection of Catholic values? 164
4. Judicial deference to Catholic values in the immediate aftermath of the 1937 Constitution 169
5. Constitutional review 1967: a Catholic marriage law for Catholic people? 171
6. An explosion of nullity grounds: the high tide mark of canon law 173
7. A new secular age of divorce. 177
8. The end of subjective nullity. 181
9. Conclusions 183

THE INFLUENCE OF THE ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH IN MALTESE FAMILY LAW AND POLICY

Ruth FARRUGIA 187

1. Introduction 187
2. Background 188
 - 2.1. Religion in Malta 188
 - 2.2. Church-State relationship 189
 - 2.3. Sources of Maltese family law 190
3. Definition of family 191
4. Intimate relationships 195
 - 4.1. Marriage 195
 - 4.2. Annulment 197
 - 4.3. Divorce 201
 - 4.4. Cohabitation 203
5. The influence of the Catholic Church in Malta today 204

JEWISH FAMILY LAW AND SECULAR LEGAL ORDERS: THE EXAMPLE OF GET REFUSAL

Matthijs DE BLOIS 207

1. Introduction 207
2. Jewish law. 208
 - 2.1. Jewish law on marriage and divorce. 209
 - 2.2. The problems of *get* refusal 211
3. Legislative incorporation: Israel; religious law as law of the State 212
 - 3.1. General 212
 - 3.2. The law of marriage and divorce. 213
 - 3.3. The Israeli approach to the *get* problem. 214
4. The approach to the *get* problem in Western secular jurisdictions 216
 - 4.1. General 216
 - 4.2. Legislative approaches to religious divorce law 217
 - 4.3. Judicial approaches 220
 - 4.3.1. Civil divorce proceedings 220
 - 4.3.2. Breach of contract. 221
 - 4.3.3. Tort 223
 - 4.3.4. Rejection of the claim 225
5. Evaluative reflections 226
 - 5.1. General 226
 - 5.2. Religious law and secular law 227

PRAYERS IN THE PLAYGROUND: RELIGION AND EDUCATION IN THE UNITED KINGDOM AND BEYOND

Frankie MCCARTHY 235

1. Introduction 235
2. The legal framework. 237
 - 2.1. Human rights. 237
 - 2.2. Education law. 238
 - 2.3. Equalities legislation. 239
3. Faith schools and the place of secular education 241
 - 3.1. (Non) faith schools in the UK. 241
 - 3.2. Flaws in the accommodationist model 242
 - 3.3. *Folgero* and *Lautsi*: towards state neutrality? 244
 - 3.4. Challenges to faith schools 247
4. Delivering the curriculum 250
 - 4.1. Religion and the school syllabus. 250
 - 4.2. Delivering the curriculum: equalities law in conflict? 252
5. School uniform and religious dress. 254
 - 5.1. Restrictions on religious dress: the Strasbourg approach. 254

5.2. Restrictions on religious dress: the UK perspective	256
6. Conflict of rights: parents versus children	260
7. Conclusion	262

PART FOUR

<i>REFLECTING A PLACE FOR RELIGION?</i>	265
---	-----

RELIGION IN THE HISTORY OF FAMILY LAW IN SCOTLAND

John FINLAY	267
-------------------	-----

1. Introduction	267
2. Family law	270
3. The household	273
4. The influence of canon law	276
5. The significance of the reformation	277
6. The significance of Roman law	283
7. The language of the law	288
8. Post 1800	293
9. Conclusion	299

ACCOMMODATING RELIGION TO THE GAY EQUALITY IMPERATIVE IN FAMILY LAW

Kenneth McK. NORRIE	303
---------------------------	-----

1. Introduction	303
2. Christian approaches to gay and lesbian equality	308
3. The changing law relating to gay and lesbian people	311
4. Accommodating religious concerns	313
5. Accommodation as defeat	315
6. The principles underpinning accommodation	318
7. The coming of marriage	327
8. Conclusion	330

RELIGION, FAMILY VALUES AND FAMILY LAW

Michael ROSIE and Fran WASOFF	333
-------------------------------------	-----

1. Introduction	333
2. Religion and the trend towards secularisation	334
3. The politics of family law reform and the voice of faith groups	336
4. The family module of the Scottish Social Attitudes Survey 2004	337
5. Operationalising “religion” – affiliation and (claimed) practice	338
6. Religious adherence and family values	341
6.1. Marriage and cohabitation	341

6.2. Age effects	342
6.3. The traditional marriage scale	343
7. Religious adherence and sexual moralities	347
7.1. Gay and lesbian adoption	350
8. Familial obligations	351
9. Discussion and conclusion	353

<i>ASSESSMENT</i>	357
-------------------------	-----

THE PLACE OF RELIGION IN FAMILY LAW: A COMPARATIVE SEARCH

Jane MAIR	359
-----------------	-----

1. Why search for religion in family law?	359
2. Religion and family law: views from the past	361
2.1. Church and State	361
2.2. Scripture as law	363
2.3. The Church in the community	364
3. Religion and family law: current dilemmas	365
3.1. Accommodating a place for religion	366
3.2. Denying a place for religion	368
3.3. Supporting a place for religion	370
3.4. Reflecting a place for religion	372
4. Should there be a place for religion in family law: continuing debates? ..	374
4.1. Religion and family law: a public/private dichotomy?	375
4.1.1. Public space for religion	375
4.1.2. The private nature of belief	376
4.1.3. Personal meaning of public relationships	377
4.2. Religion and family law: form or function?	378
4.2.1. Form of family relationships	378
4.2.2. Function of family relationships	379
4.2.3. Form of religion	380
4.2.4. Functions of religion	381
4.3. Religion and family law: certainty or chaos?	382
4.3.1. Clear laws but chaotic meaning	382
4.3.2. Clear belief but chaotic laws	383
5. The results of our search	384