

***International Human Rights***  
**Problems of Law, Policy,  
and Practice**

**Fourth Edition**

**Late Richard B. Lillich**  
*of the University of Virginia*

**Hurst Hannum**  
*Professor of International Law*  
*The Fletcher School of Law and Diplomacy,*  
*Tufts University*  
*Sir Y.K. Pao Professor of Public Law,*  
*University of Hong Kong*

**S. James Anaya**  
*The University of Arizona*

**Dinah L. Shelton**  
*The George Washington University*

**ASPEN**  
PUBLISHERS

76 Ninth Avenue, New York, NY 10011  
<http://lawschool.aspenpublishers.com>

# Table of Contents

<i>Preface</i>	xxxi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xxxiii

## Chapter I 1

### The Concept of Human Rights

#### *From Morality to Law: The Abolition of Slavery*

I. <i>The Concept of Human Rights</i>	2
II. <i>The Movement to Abolish Slavery and the Slave Trade</i>	3
A. Introduction	3
B. The Moral and Philosophical Evolution	6
David Brion Davis, <i>The Problem of Slavery in the Age of Revolution 1770-1823</i>	6
Roger Anstey, <i>The Atlantic Slave Trade and British Abolition 1760-1810</i>	6
C. Economic and Political Factors	8
Howard Temperley, <i>The Ideology of Antislavery, In The Abolition of the Atlantic Slave Trade: Origins and Effects in Europe, Africa and the Americas</i>	8
James Walvin, <i>The Public Campaign in England against Slavery, 1787-1834</i>	9
D. The Rhetoric of Abolition	11
Simon Bolivar, <i>Message to the Congress of Bolivia (May 25, 1826)</i>	11
Audrey A. Fisch, <i>American Slaves in Victorian England: Abolitionist Politics in Popular Literature and Culture</i>	12
Frederick Douglass, <i>The Meaning of July Fourth for the Negro, Rochester, NY (July 5, 1852)</i>	13
E. The Legal Evolution	14
The Case of James Sommersett	14
Suzanne Miers, <i>Slavery and the Slave Trade as International Issues 1890-1939</i>	23
Comments and Questions	28
III. <i>The Philosophical Underpinnings of Human Rights</i>	31
A. Natural Law	31
S. James Anaya, <i>Indigenous Peoples in International Law</i>	31
B. Legal Positivism	35
C. Critical Legal Studies	35
D. Feminist Perspectives	36
Hilary Charlesworth, <i>Feminist Methods in International Law</i>	36

E.	Cultural Relativism	38
	Amartya Sen, Human Rights and Asian Values	39
	Comments and Questions	43
IV.	<i>A Brief History of Human Rights in International Law and Institutions</i>	46
	John P. Humphrey, The International Law of Human Rights in the Middle Twentieth Century	46
V.	<i>Final Comments and Questions</i>	53
<b>Chapter 2</b>		<b>55</b>
<b>Guaranteeing Human Rights by Treaty</b>		
<i>Is There a Right to a Safe and Healthy Environment?</i>		
I.	<i>The State of the Global Environment and Human Well-Being</i>	57
	United Nations Environment Program, Geo Yearbook: An Overview of Our Changing Environment 2004-2005	57
II.	<i>The Protection of Human Rights through Treaties</i>	62
	A. Why Rights and Why Treaties?	62
	Dinah L. Shelton, Human Rights, Environmental Rights, and the Right to Environment	62
	Okechukwu Ibeanu, Adverse effects of the illicit movement and dumping of toxic and dangerous products and wastes on the enjoyment of human rights	64
	Richard B. Bilder, Rethinking International Human Rights: Some Basic Questions	64
	Comments and Questions	66
	B. Human Rights Provisions in the UN Charter	67
	1. The Content of the Charter	67
	The United Nations and Human Rights	67
	2. Invocation of the Human Rights Clauses on the International Level	68
	Legal Consequences for States of the Continued Presence of South Africa in Namibia (South West Africa)	69
	Egon Schwelb, The International Court of Justice and the Human Rights Clauses of the Charter	70
	3. The Domestic Status of the Charter's Human Rights Clauses	73
	Oscar Schachter, The Charter and the Constitution: The Human Rights Provisions in American Law	73
	Note: U.S. Recognition of the Legal Status of the Human Rights Clauses	76
	Comments and Questions	78
	C. UN Human Rights Law-Making	79
	Dinah L. Shelton, Human Rights	83
	1. Completing the International Bill of Rights	85
	Louis Henkin, Introduction	86

2.	Issue-Specific Human Rights Treaties	87
	Note: Specialized Agencies	89
3.	Quality Control	91
	Stephen P. Marks, <i>Emerging Human Rights: A New Generation for the 1980s?</i>	91
	A. H. Robertson, <i>Human Rights in the World</i>	92
	Note: UN Action	94
	UN General Assembly Res. 41/120	94
	International League for Human Rights, <i>Human Rights at the United Nations: New Standard Setting</i>	95
4.	The Evolution of a Claimed Right to Environmental Quality	96
	Dinah L. Shelton, <i>Human Rights, Environmental Rights, and the Right to Environment</i>	96
	Note: On the Evolution of Global, Regional, and National Standards	99
	Comments and Questions	103
III.	<i>Are Human Rights Treaties Different from Other International Legal Norms?</i>	105
A.	Interpretation	106
	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties	106
	<i>Soering v. United Kingdom</i>	107
	<i>Selmouni v. France</i>	108
	<i>Juan Humberto Sanchez Case, Interpretation of the Judgment on Preliminary Objections, Merits and Reparations</i>	110
B.	Reservations	110
	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties	111
	Note: U.S. Reservations, Understandings, and Declarations to the Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	113
	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights: The Administration's Proposed Reservations, Understandings and Declarations to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	113
	Human Rights Committee, Issues relating to reservations made upon ratification or accession to the Covenant or the Optional Protocols thereto, or in relation to declarations under Article 41 of the Covenant	116
	Human Rights Committee, Consideration of Reports Submitted By States Parties under Article 40 of the Covenant, Comments of the Committee on the Report of the United States of America	121
	International Law Commission, Annual Report	123
C.	Termination of Treaties	129
	Human Rights Committee, <i>Continuity of Obligations</i>	129
D.	Are Human Rights Treaties Superior to Other International Legal Regimes?	130
	Comments and Questions	131
IV.	<i>Final Comments and Questions</i>	132

<b>Chapter 3</b>	<b>135</b>
<b>The Development of Human Rights Norms Through Non-Binding Instruments</b>	
<i>How and Why Do New International Human Rights Norms Emerge other than by Treaty?</i>	
I. <i>Introduction: The Role of "Soft Law" in Human Rights Law Making</i>	136
Dinah L. Shelton, Commentary and Conclusions, in <i>Commitment and Compliance: The Role of Non-Binding Norms in the International Legal System</i>	137
II. <i>The Universal Declaration of Human Rights</i>	143
A. <i>The Making of the Universal Declaration</i>	143
John P. Humphrey, <i>The Universal Declaration of Human Rights: Its History, Impact and Juridical Character</i>	143
B. <i>The Legal Status of the Declaration</i>	146
1. <i>The Historical Perspective</i>	146
Egon Schwelb, <i>The Influence of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights on International and National Law</i>	147
Note: Customary International Law	152
2. <i>Subsequent Developments in the Legal Status of the Declaration</i>	153
Restatement (Third) of the Foreign Relations Law of the United States §702	156
International Law Association, <i>Committee on the Enforcement of Human Rights Law, Final Report on the Status of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights in National and International Law</i>	157
Note: Other United Nations and Regional Human Rights Declarations	161
Comments and Questions	163
III. <i>The Emergence of New Human Rights Norms: The Rights of Indigenous Peoples and Maya Land Claims in Southern Belize</i>	164
A. <i>The Developing Rights of Indigenous Peoples</i>	164
B. <i>The Adjudication of Maya Land Claims by the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights</i>	167
S. James Anaya, <i>The Maya Petition to the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights: Indigenous Land and Resource Rights, and the Conflict over Logging and Oil in Southern Belize</i>	168
Note: The <i>Awás Tingni</i> and <i>Dann</i> Cases	172
Inter-American Commission on Human Rights, Report 40/04, Case 12.053 (Maya Indigenous communities of the Toledo District of Belize)	176
Comments and Questions	182
IV. <i>Norm Building in Related Areas</i>	183
A. <i>Minorities</i>	183
Hurst Hannum, <i>The Rights of Persons Belonging to Minorities</i>	184

Human Rights Committee, General Comment No. 23 (Art. 27)	191
B. Self-Determination	194
Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, Right to Self-determination, General Recommendation XXI Comments and Questions	195
V. <i>The Model or "Soft Law" Approach in the Criminal Justice Area</i>	197
A. International Norms Governing the Treatment of Prisoners	199
B. Status of the Standard Minimum Rules	200
C. Applying the "Model Law" or "Soft Law" Approach to Specific Subjects	200
1. Treatment of Prisoners	202
2. Juvenile Offenders	202
3. Standards for the Administration of Justice	202
Nigel Rodley, <i>The Treatment of Prisoners Under             International Law</i>	203
Alfred Heijder, <i>Codes of Professional Ethics Against Torture             Comments and Questions</i>	204
Comments and Questions	206
VI. <i>Final Comments and Questions</i>	206

## Chapter 4 209

### Human Rights in Extremis

#### *How Can Human Rights Be Protected in Civil Strife and Armed Conflict?*

I. <i>A Mote in the Eye of Freedom: Interrogation at Abu Ghraib Prison, Iraq</i>	211
Dana Priest and Barton Gellman, <i>U.S. Decries Abuse but Defends     Interrogations; "Stress and Duress" Tactics Used on Terrorism     Suspects Held in Secret Overseas Facilities</i>	212
II. <i>Human Rights in Civil Strife and States of Emergency</i>	216
Joan Fitzpatrick, <i>Human Rights in Crisis, The International System for     Protecting Rights During States of Emergency</i>	217
Note: Humanitarian Law as a Limitation on the Right of Derogation: Civil Strife and Internal Armed Conflict Contrasted	223
Note: Monitoring States of Emergency	224
Human Rights Committee, <i>States of Emergency (Article 4)</i>	225
Habeas Corpus in Emergency Situations	228
Note: Limitation Clauses	229
Comments and Questions	230
III. <i>The Traditional Law of War: International Armed Conflict</i>	230
Note: Historical Roots of the Concern for Human Rights in the Law of War	230
G.I.A.D. Draper, <i>Human Rights and the Law of War</i>	231
A. <i>Protecting Combatants: The First Three 1949 Geneva Conventions</i>	233
Third Geneva Convention Relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War	233

	U.S. Army, Law of Land Warfare	235
	U.S. Army, Intelligence Interrogation	237
B.	Protecting Civilians: The Fourth Geneva Convention	239
	Fourth Geneva Convention on the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War	239
C.	Subsequent Developments: Protocol I	241
	Richard R. Baxter, Modernizing the Law of War	242
	Note: The Impact of Protocol I	243
	Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and Relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts (Protocol I)	244
	Comments and Questions	247
IV.	<i>Expanding Traditional Protections: Internal Armed Conflicts</i>	247
A.	Common Article 3: Its Status and Content	247
	Daniel Smith, New Protections for Victims of International Armed Conflicts: The Proposed Ratification of Protocol II by the United States	247
	Case Concerning Military and Paramilitary Activities in and Against Nicaragua (Nicaragua v. United States)	249
B.	Protocol II: Its Scope and Content	250
	Richard R. Baxter, Modernizing the Law of War	250
	Note: The U.S. Position on Protocol II	252
	Note: UN Peacekeeping	253
	Comments and Questions	253
V.	<i>Where Does Responsibility Lie for Violations of the Law of War?</i>	254
	In re Yamashita	255
	Note: The Treatment of Command Responsibility in U.S. Domestic Law	258
	Interview with Guy Womack by Chris Matthews	259
	Comments and Questions	261
VI.	<i>Modern Warfare: Distinguishing Combatants from Civilians</i>	261
	Lieutenant Duffy's Statement	262
	Mark Bowden, Black Hawk Down, A Story of Modern War	265
	Note: The First Gulf War	266
	Note: Afghanistan and the Second Gulf War	267
VII.	<i>The "War on Terror": Emergency, Armed Conflict, or Business as Usual?</i>	267
	George W. Bush, Address to a Joint Session of Congress and to the American People	268
A.	Prosecuting Those Persons Responsible for Ill-Treatment at Ābu Ghraib	269
	1. The Dramatis Personae	269
	2. The Legal Arguments	271
	Memorandum from Assistant Attorney General Jay S. Bybee	271
	Note: Subsequent U.S. Interrogation Policies	279
	Note: Should Torture Always Be Prohibited?	281
B.	Guantánamo and "Illegal Combatants"	281
	Third Geneva Convention Relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War	282

Fourth Geneva Convention Relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War	284
Memorandum from Assistant Attorney General Jay S. Bybee	284
Silvia Borelli, Casting Light on the Legal Black Hole: International Law and Detentions Abroad in the "War on Terror"	292
Memorandum from the President	294
C. Military Commissions	296
Detention, Treatment, and Trial of Certain Non-Citizens in the War Against Terrorism	296
Hamdan v. Rumsfeld	301
D. Renditions	307
Joan Fitzpatrick, Rendition and Transfer in the War Against Terrorism: Guantánamo and Beyond	308
E. A Congressional Response	310
H.R. 3038	310
Thomas M. Franck, Editorial Comment, "Criminals, Combatants, or What? An Examination of the Role of Law in Responding to the Threat of Terror"	315
Comments and Questions	316
VIII. Final Comments and Questions	319

## Chapter 5 323

### Who is Obligated to Promote and Protect Human rights?

#### *Oil Exploration and Exploitation in the Niger River Delta*

I. <i>The Problem: Oil Exploration and Exploitation in Nigeria</i>	325
II. <i>The Obligations of States</i>	326
Note: The African Human Rights System	326
Christof Heyns, The African Regional Human Rights System: The African Charter	327
A. The Language of Obligation	334
Human Rights Committee, General Comment No. 31, The Nature of the General Legal Obligation Imposed on States Parties to the Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	334
<i>Velásquez Rodríguez</i> Case, Inter-Am. Ct. H.R.	338
<i>Öneryıldiz v. Turkey</i>	345
Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, General Comment No. 3, The nature of States parties obligations (Art. 2, para. 1)	353
The Social and Economic Rights Action Center and the Center for Economic and Social Rights v. Nigeria	355
B. Balancing State Obligations to Protect with Individual Freedom and Autonomy	364
Brüggemann and Scheuten v. Germany	364
Open Door and Dublin Well Woman v. Ireland	365



	Pretty v. the United Kingdom	367
	Comments and Questions	369
III.	<i>Corporate Responsibility</i>	373
	Dinah L. Shelton, Protecting Human Rights in a Globalized World	373
	Rhoda E. Howard-Hassman, The Second Great Transformation: Human Rights Leapfrogging in the Era of Globalization	375
A.	Codes of Conduct	377
	Sub-Commission on the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights, Norms on the Responsibilities of Transnational Corporations and Other Business Enterprises with Regard to Human Rights	379
	Report of the United Nations High Commissioner on Human Rights on the Responsibilities of Transnational Corporations and Related Business Enterprises with Regard to Human Rights	382
B.	Potential Domestic Liability of Corporations for Human Rights Abuses	385
	Ralph Steinhardt, Laying One Bankrupt Critique to Rest: <i>Sosa v.</i> <i>Alvarez Machain</i> and the Future of International Human Rights Litigation in U.S. Courts	386
	<i>Wiwa v. Royal Dutch Petroleum Co. and Shell Transport &amp;</i> <i>Trading Co. P.L.C.</i>	387
C.	A Response from Business	392
	SustainAbility, The Changing Landscape of Liability: A Director's Guide to Trends in Corporate Environmental, Social and Economic Liability	392
	Comments and Questions	394
IV.	<i>Do International Organizations Have Human Rights Obligations?</i>	396
A.	International Financial Institutions	396
	IBRD/World Bank, Development and Human Rights: The Role of the World Bank	399
	Kelly Currah et al., Doing The Rights Thing? The World Bank and The Human Rights of People Living In Poverty	401
B.	The World Trade Organization	406
	Robert Howse and Makau Mutua, Protecting Human Rights in a Global Economy: Challenges for the World Trade Organization	406
	World Trade Organization, Trade and Labour Standards	409
	Agreement reached on WTO Waiver for "Conflict Diamonds" Under the Kimberly Process Certification Scheme for Rough Diamonds	410
	Report on the High Commissioner for Human Rights, Liberalization of Trade in Services and Human Rights	411
C.	Intellectual Property Issues	413
	Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Protection of Intellectual Property Under The TRIPS Agreement	413
	World Trade Organization, Declaration On The TRIPS Agreement And Public Health	416

Commission Human Rights, The right of everyone to the enjoyment of the highest attainable standard of physical and mental health	417
Commission Human Rights Res. 2005/23, Access to medication in the context of pandemics such as HIV/AIDS, tuberculosis and malaria	420
D. Peacekeeping	422
Report of the International Law Commission on its 56th Session	423
Column Lynch, U.N. Sexual Abuse Alleged in Congo, Peacekeepers Accused in Draft Report	426
Report of the Secretary-General, UN Special Measures for Protection from Sexual Exploitation and Sexual Abuse	428
Comments and Questions	429
V. <i>The Responsibility of Individuals for Human Rights Violations</i>	430
Erica-Irene A. Daes, Freedom of the Individual under Law: an Analysis of Article 29 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights	431
Commission on Human Rights, Compilation of the essential aspects of replies received on the pre-draft declaration on human social responsibilities	435
Comments and Questions	437
VI. <i>Final Comments and Questions</i>	438

## Chapter 6 439

### DOMESTIC ENFORCEMENT MECHANISMS

#### *Are States' Courts Bound to Apply International Human Rights Norms?*

I. <i>Introduction: The Relationship Between International and Domestic Legal Systems</i>	440
II. <i>U.S. Courts and the Right of Juvenile Offenders Not to be Executed</i>	442
A. Finding the Parameters of Domestic Legal Protections in Light of International Norms	442
Roper v. Simmons	443
Harold Hongju Koh, Review Essay: Why Do Nations Obey International Law	449
Comments and Questions	452
B. The Application of Treaty Provisions by Domestic Courts	453
1. Judicial Treatment of Reservations to Multilateral Treaties	454
Domingues v. State of Nevada	456
Curtis A. Bradley, The Juvenile Death Penalty and International Law	460
2. The Doctrine of (Non) Self-Executing Treaties	462
Note: The Fuji Case	462
Sei Fujii v. State	463
The U.S. Declarations of Non-Self-Execution	466
Hamdan v. Rumsfeld	469
Comments and Questions	471

C.	The Judicial Application of Customary International Law	473
	Brief for the Human Rights Committee of the Bar of England and Wales, Human Rights Advocates, Human Rights Watch, and the World Organization for Human Rights as Amici Curiae in Support of Respondents	473
	Joan Fitzpatrick, The Role of Domestic Courts in Enforcing International Human Rights Law	477
	Customary International Law Under the Alien Tort Statute — Filartiga and Beyond	478
	Filartiga v. Peña-Irala	479
	Sosa v. Alvarez-Machain	485
	Comments and Questions	494
	Note: The State Action and Act of State Doctrines	498
	Note: Foreign Sovereign Immunity	500
III.	<i>The Justiciability of Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights</i>	501
	Committee on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights, The Right to the Highest Attainable Standard of Health	502
	Minister of Health et al. v. Treatment Action Campaign et al.	511
	Comments and Questions	526
	Note: The Use of International Human Rights Law in Foreign Jurisdictions	527
	Supreme Court of the Russian Federation, Decision on the applicability by ordinary courts of the universally recognized principles and norms of international law and the international treaties of the Russian Federation	529
IV.	<i>Final Comments and Questions</i>	532
 <b>Chapter 7</b>		<b>533</b>
<b>UN Mechanisms for Addressing Violations of Human Rights</b>		
<b><i>What Petition and Other Procedures Are Available for Implementing Human Rights Standards?</i></b>		
I.	<i>Introduction</i>	534
II.	<i>The Situation in Greece: An Early Test Case</i>	536
	A. Resolution 1503: High Expectations	536
	B. Historical Note	536
	Greece: Justice in Blinkers	538
	Human Rights Report on Greece	539
	C. Communication Alleging Violation of Human Rights in Greece	539
	D. The Sub-Commissions Response to the Communication	541
	Disappointing Start to New U.N. Procedure on Human Rights	541
	E. The Reaction of the Greek Regime	543
	Letter Dated 12 August 1973 from the Permanent Representative of Greece to the United Nations Addressed to the Secretary-General	543

F.	The Overthrow of the Greek Regime and the Sub-Commission's Role Therein	545
	Statement by Amnesty International and the International Student Movement for the UN	545
III.	<i>Analyzing the Procedures and Problems of Resolution 1503</i>	546
	Frank C. Newman, The New U.N. Procedures for Human Rights Complaints: Reform, Status Quo, or Chamber of Horrors?	546
	Philip Alston, The Commission on Human Rights	548
	Nigel S. Rodley and David Weissbrodt, United Nations Nontreaty Procedures for Dealing with Human Rights Violations	552
	Report of the independent expert of the Commission on Human Rights [Charlotte Abaka] on the situation of human rights in Liberia submitted under the 1503 procedure	554
IV.	<i>Other UN Mechanisms for Investigating Alleged Human Rights Abuses</i>	562
A.	Petition Procedures	562
B.	Non-Petition Procedures	564
	Philip Alston, The Commission on Human Rights	564
	Commission on Human Rights, Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment	572
	Commission on Human Rights, Question of Arbitrary Detention	572
	Commission on Human Rights, Human Rights and Indigenous Issues	572
	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, The Working Group on Arbitrary Detention	573
	Report of the twelfth meeting of special rapporteurs/representatives, independent experts and chairpersons of working groups of the special procedures of the Commission on Human Rights and of the advisory services programme	577
	Comments and Questions	579
V.	<i>Monitoring the Implementation of UN Human Rights Treaties</i>	583
A.	Monitoring Bodies	583
B.	State Reporting	584
	Office Of The United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, Effective Functioning of Human Rights Mechanisms Treaty Bodies	586
	Dinah Shelton, Compliance Mechanisms [Periodic Reports]	588
	Congressional Record, S 8400-8401	590
C.	Individual Communications	592
	Toonen v. Australia	592
	Note: Should There Be an Optional Protocol to the Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights?	599
D.	Interstate Complaints	600
E.	General Comments	600
F.	Strengthening the Treaty System	601
	Final Report on Enhancing the Long-Term Effectiveness of the United Nations Human Rights Treaty System	602

General Assembly Res. 57/202, Effective implementation of international instruments on human rights, including reporting obligations under international instruments on human rights	609
Office of The United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, Effective Functioning of Human Rights Mechanisms Treaty Bodies	612
Comments and Questions	615
VI. <i>Final Comments and Questions</i>	615
<b>Chapter 8</b>	<b>617</b>
<b>The European System for the Protection of Human Rights</b>	
<i>Can Regional Systems to Protect Human Rights Be More Effective than UN Mechanisms?</i>	
I. <i>Universal and Regional Norms</i>	619
Dinah L. Shelton, The Promise of Regional Human Rights Systems	619
II. <i>The Council of Europe and the European Convention on Human Rights</i>	621
Dinah L. Shelton, The Boundaries of Human Rights Jurisdiction in Europe	621
A. Jurisdiction	624
Note: Civilian Deaths in Iraq	624
Bankovic and Others v. Belgium and Others	626
Issa and Others v. Turkey	635
Al-Adsani v. United Kingdom	639
Comments and Questions	647
B. The Interpretation and Application of Substantive Rights in the European Convention: Freedom of Expression	648
Handyside v. United Kingdom	649
Jersild v. Denmark	660
Otto-Preminger-Institut v. Austria	674
Note: Other Substantive Rights	681
Comments and Questions	682
C. Seeking Compliance with European Human Rights Norms	683
1. Monitoring Judgments of the European Court of Human Rights	683
Council of Europe Committee of Ministers to supervise the execution of the Human Rights Court's judgments	684
Council of Europe Parliamentary Assembly Resolution 1226 (2000), Execution of judgments of the European Court of Human Rights	686
Council of European Parliamentary Assembly, Resolution 1411 (2004), Implementation of decisions of the European Court of Human Rights	688

2.	Monitoring Other Human Rights Obligations of Members of the Council of Europe	690
	Committee of Ministers, Declaration on Compliance with Commitments Accepted by Member States of the Council of Europe	691
	Procedure for Implementing the Declaration of 10 November 1994, on Compliance with Commitments Accepted by Member States of the Council of Europe	692
	Note: The Case of Georgia	693
	Parliamentary Assembly, Georgia's application for membership of the Council of Europe	693
	Parliamentary Assembly, Resolution 1257 (2001) of Sept. 25, 2001: Honouring of obligations and commitments by Georgia	696
	Compliance with Commitments and Obligations: The Situation in Georgia	699
	Comments and Questions	701
D.	The Present Crisis and the Future of the System	701
	Explanatory report to the [draft] Protocol No. 14 to the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, amending the Convention's control system	702
	Resolution (2004) 3, on Judgments Revealing an Underlying Systemic Problem	704
	Comments and Questions	705
III.	<i>Other Human Rights Activities of the Council of Europe, European Union, and Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe</i>	706
	Dinah L. Shelton, The Boundaries of Human Rights Jurisdiction in Europe	706
	Comments and Questions	715
IV.	<i>Final Comments and Questions</i>	715
 <b>Chapter 9</b>		<b>717</b>
<b>Human Rights in the Americas</b>		
<i>Responding to Disappearances in Argentina</i>		
I.	<i>Human Rights in Argentina</i>	718
	Inter-American Commission on Human Rights, Report on the Situation of Human Rights in Argentina	718
II.	<i>Evolution of the Human Rights System in the Americas</i>	720
	Cecelia Medina, The Inter-American Commission on Human Rights and the Inter-American Court of Human Rights: Reflections on a Joint Venture	721

Inter-American Court of Human Rights, Interpretation of the American Declaration of the Rights and Duties of Man within the Framework of Article 64 of the American Convention on Human Rights	724
Note: Advisory Opinions of the Court	730
Comments and Questions	731
III. <i>The Response of the System to Disappearances in Argentina</i>	731
A. Country Reports	731
Inter-American Commission on Human Rights, Report on the Situation of Human Rights in Argentina	731
Thomas Buergenthal, Robert Norris, and Dinah Shelton, Protecting Human Rights in the Americas, Selected Problems	745
Report on the Situation of Human Rights in Argentina	747
Comments and Questions	749
B. Individual Petitions	749
Dinah Shelton, The Inter-American Human Rights System	749
1. Provisional Measures	753
Reggiardo Tolosa Case, Order of the President of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights of November 19, 1993	753
2. Admissibility and Merits	756
Res. No 31/78, Case 2553, (Argentina), decision of Nov. 18, 1978	756
Association of the Bar of the City of New York, Committee on International Human Rights, The Inter-American Commission: A Promise Unfulfilled	759
Note: The Concept of Continuing Violations	763
Blake v. Guatemala (Preliminary Objections)	763
3. Friendly Settlement	765
Report No. 21/00, Case 12.059, Carmen Aguiar De Lapacó (Argentina)	765
Comments and Questions	766
C. Compliance with the Recommendations of the IACHR	768
Inter-American Commission on Human Rights, Annual Report 2004	769
D. Resolutions of OAS Political Bodies	770
Thomas Buergenthal, The Inter-American System for the Protection of Human Rights	771
Resolution of the XVII Meeting of Consultation	771
E. Proceedings before the Inter-American Court	772
Reparations	773
Inter-American Court of Human Rights, <i>Garrido And Baigorria</i> Case (Reparations) (Art. 63(1) of the American Convention on Human Rights)	773
Comments and Questions	779
IV. <i>The United States and the Inter-American System</i>	780
Note: Voting Rights and Self-Determination in the Americas	781

Inter-American Commission on Human Rights, Report 98/03, Case 11.204, Statehood Solidarity Committee (United States)	781
Comments and Questions	785
V. <i>Final Comments and Questions</i>	785
 <b>Chapter 10</b>	 <b>787</b>
<b>Coercing Compliance with Human Rights Norms: Sanctions and Armed Intervention</b>	
<i>Can the International Community Prevent Human Rights Violations by Threatening or Using Force?</i>	
I. <i>Disaster in Darfur</i>	788
Mission to the Sudan — The Darfur Crisis, Report of the Representative of the Secretary-General on internally displaced persons, Francis M. Deng	790
II. <i>Economic Sanctions</i>	793
A. The League of Nations	793
B. The UN Charter and Southern Rhodesia	794
Myers S. McDougal and W. Michael Reisman, Rhodesia and the United Nations: The Lawfulness of International Concern	796
Dean Acheson, The Arrogance of International Lawyers	799
C. Modern UN Sanctions	801
Security Council Resolution 661	802
Committee on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights, The Relationship Between Economic Sanctions and Respect for Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	804
UN Sub-Commission on the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights, The Adverse Consequences of Economic Sanctions on the Enjoyment of Human Rights	805
Thomas G. Weiss, Sanctions as a Foreign Policy Tool: Weighing Humanitarian Impulses	813
August Reinisch, Developing Human Rights and Humanitarian Law Accountability of the Security Council for the Imposition of Economic Sanctions	814
Note: Regional or Unilateral Sanctions	815
Comments and Questions	817
III. <i>U.S. Implementation of International Sanctions</i>	818
Note: The Legal Framework	818
Legislative Reference Service, Library of Congress, The United Nations Participation Act Sections Relating to Economic and Military Action	818
Diggs v. Shultz	820
Kenneth Roth, Executive Director of Human Rights Watch, The Role of U.S. Sanctions Policies in Promoting Human Rights	821
Note: Think Globally, Act Locally: Local and State-sponsored Sanctions	824
Crosby v. National Foreign Trade Council	824



Comments and Questions	828
IV. <i>Armed Intervention</i>	828
A. Intervention by the United Nations	828
1. Somalia	829
Sean D. Murphy, Humanitarian Intervention: The United Nations in an Evolving World Order	829
2. Haiti	832
Security Council Resolution 940	833
Security Council Resolution 1542	835
Todd Howland, Op-ed, In Haiti, Rhetoric Trumps Human Rights	837
3. The Consequences of Non-Intervention: Rwanda	838
Report of the Independent Inquiry into the Actions of the United Nations during the 1994 Genocide in Rwanda	838
B. Unilateral or Regional Intervention	846
1. The Consequences of Intervention: Kosovo	847
Independent International Commission on Kosovo, Kosovo Report	847
Note: The Second Gulf War	852
C. Proposed Criteria for Armed Intervention	853
The Responsibility to Protect	854
Comments and Questions	864
V. <i>The International Response to Darfur</i>	867
Acting High Commissioner for Human Rights Bertrand Ramcharan, Statement to the UN Security Council	867
The Crisis in Darfur, Statement of Secretary of State Colin Powell before the Senate Foreign Relations Committee	870
Transcript of the Candidates First Debate in the 2004 Presidential Campaign	872
Comments and Questions	875
VI. Final Comments and Questions	877
<b>Chapter 11</b>	<b>881</b>
<b>International Criminal Law</b>	
<b><i>Can We Deter Human Rights Violations by Using the Criminal Justice Process?</i></b>	
I. <i>Introduction</i>	882
II. <i>The 1973 Coup in Chile and Its Aftermath</i>	883
A. Pinochet in Power	883
B. Pinochet Indicted	885
III. <i>Efforts to Bring the International Criminal Justice Process to Bear upon Human Rights Violators</i>	887
Antonio Cassese, International Criminal Law	888
John Carey, UN Protection of Civil and Political Rights	889

Steven R. Ratner and Jason S. Abrams, Accountability for Human Rights Atrocities in International Law	892
A. The Yugoslav War Crimes Tribunal	894
Diane Orentlicher, Yugoslavia War Crimes Tribunal	894
B. The International Tribunal for Rwanda	898
Christina M. Carroll, An Assessment of the Role and Effectiveness of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda and the Rwandan National Justice System in Dealing with the Mass Atrocities of 1994	898
Kingsley Chiedu Moghalu, The Evolving Architecture of International Law: Image and Reality of War Crimes Justice: External Perceptions of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda	900
C. Other Country-specific Tribunals	906
Note: The Special Court for Sierra Leone	906
Note: "Extraordinary Chambers" in Cambodia	908
Comments and Questions	909
IV. <i>The International Criminal Court</i>	912
Philippe Kirsch and Valerie Oosterveld, Negotiating an Institution for the Twenty-First Century: Multilateral Diplomacy and the International Criminal Court	912
Global rights? [A Debate between A.C. Grayling and David Rieff]	917
A. U.S. Attitudes Toward an International Criminal Court	924
B. The United States Signs and "Unsigns" the ICC Statute	926
President Clinton, Statement on Signature of the International Criminal Court Treaty	926
Letter from Under-Secretary of State John R. Bolton to the Secretary-General of the United Nations	928
Under Secretary of State of Political Affairs Marc Grossman, American Foreign Policy and the International Criminal Court	928
Jack Goldsmith, The Self-Defeating International Criminal Court	931
C. Exempting the United States from ICC Jurisdiction	936
Statute of the International Criminal Court	936
David J. Scheffer, Original Intent at The Global Criminal Court	937
Note: The Early Work of the ICC	938
Comments and Questions	939
V. <i>Universal Jurisdiction</i>	940
Menno Kamminga, Lessons Learned from the Exercise of Universal Jurisdiction in Respect of Gross Human Rights Offenses	941
Diane Orentlicher, Whose Justice? Reconciling Universal Jurisdiction with Democratic Principles	949
Note: The Belgian Experience	950
Steven R. Ratner, Editorial Comment, Belgium's War Crimes Statute: A Postmortem	951
Case Concerning the Arrest Warrant of 11 April 2000 (Democratic Republic of the Congo v. Belgium)	953

Case Concerning the Arrest Warrant of 11 April 2000 (Democratic Republic of the Congo v. Belgium) (joint separate opinion of Judges Higgins, Kooijmans, and Buergenthal)	955
Comments and Questions	958
VI. <i>The “Piecemeal” Convention Approach Coupled with Domestic Enforcement</i>	959
A. Slavery and Apartheid	960
B. Torture	961
C. Terrorism	963
D. Other Transnational Crimes	965
Comments and Questions	966
VII. <i>The Exercise of National Jurisdiction under Domestic Law: Amnesties and Prosecutions</i>	966
Note: Human Rights Prosecutions in Argentina	966
Diane Orentlicher, Settling Accounts: The Duty to Prosecute Human Rights Violations of a Prior Regime	968
Note: Non-judicial Alternatives	972
Arthur Asiimwe, Rwanda Estimates 1 Million Fake Genocide Charges	973
Comments and Questions	974
VIII. <i>Final Comments and Questions</i>	976

## Chapter 12 979

### The Problem of Fact-Finding and Evidence

#### *How Are Human Rights Violations Investigated?*

I. <i>The Challenge: To Find Out What Is Really Happening</i>	980
II. <i>Gathering the Facts: Allegations of Judicial Persecution of Mapuche Leaders in Chile</i>	981
A. Fact-Finding by Nongovernmental Organizations	981
International Federation for Human Rights, Chile – The Mapuche People Between Oblivion and Exclusion	981
Diane Orentlicher, Bearing Witness: The Art and Science of Human Rights Fact-Finding	988
Hans Thoolen and Berth Verstappen, Human Rights Missions: A Study of the Fact-Finding Practice of Non-Governmental Organizations	992
Hurst Hannum, Fact-Finding by Non-Governmental Human Rights Organizations	994
Andrew F. Smith, International Conflict and the Media, A Curriculum Guide: Incubator Baby Incident	995
B. Fact-Finding by the UN and Other Inter-Governmental Organizations	999
Report of the Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights and fundamental freedoms of indigenous people, Mr. Rodolfo Stavenhagen (Addendum: Mission to Chile)	999

Government of Chile, Report I — Recommendations of the Special Rapporteur on the Situation of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms of Indigenous Chileans	1004
Report on the situation of human rights in Myanmar, submitted by Mr. Paulo Sérgio Pinheiro, Special Rapporteur	1006
M. Cherif Bassiouni, Appraising UN Justice-Related Fact-Finding Missions	1012
C. The Need for General Standards for Fact-Finding by Intergovernmental Organizations	1017
Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, Training Manual on Human Rights Monitoring	1017
Belgrade Minimal Rules of Procedure for International Human Rights Fact-Finding Missions	1025
D. Fact-Finding by Judicial and Quasi-Judicial Bodies	1027
Inter-American Court of Human Rights, Case of the Mayagna (Sumo) Community of Awás Tingni: Transcript of the public hearing on the merits, November 16, 17, and 18, 2000, at the seat of the Court (unofficial translation)	1029
Comments and Questions	1039
III. <i>Evaluating the Facts</i>	1041
A. Admissibility and Evaluation of Evidence	1041
The Case of the Mayagna (Sumo) Awás Tingni Community v. Nicaragua	1042
B. The Burden and Standard of Proof	1044
Bertrand G. Ramcharan, Evidence	1044
Velásquez Rodríguez v. Honduras	1047
Gangaram Panday v. Suriname	1053
Bleier v. Uruguay	1054
Sevtap Veznedaroglu v. Turkey	1055
Comments and Questions	1061
IV. <i>Final Comments and Questions</i>	1062

## Chapter 13 1063

### Human Rights and Foreign Policy

#### *The United States–China Relationship*

I. <i>Human Rights and U.S. Foreign Policy</i>	1065
Keuneth Cmiel, The Emergence of Human Rights Politics in the United States	1065
Richard B. Bilder, Human Rights and U.S. Foreign Policy: Short-Term Prospects	1070
A. Congressional Action: Laying the Foundation	1072
Richard B. Lillich, U.S. Foreign Policy, Human Rights, and Foreign Trade and Investment in Private Investors Abroad — Problems and Solutions	1072
B. Presidential Human Rights Policies and their Critics, 1975 – 2005	1074

1.	Almost at the Beginning: President Carter	1074
	Cyrus R. Vance, Human Rights and Foreign Policy	1075
	Henry A. Kissinger, Continuity and Change in American Foreign Policy	1078
	U.S. Institute for Peace, U.S. Human Rights Policy: A 20 Year Assessment	1082
	Orville H. Schell Jr., Carter on Rights — A Re-Evaluation	1086
2.	Selective Rights, Selective Application: The Reagan Administration	1087
	International Commission of Jurists, Human Rights and U.S. Foreign Policy	1087
	Art Buchwald, Moderate Repression	1089
	International Commission of Jurists, Human Rights and U.S. Foreign Policy	1090
	U.S. Institute of Peace, Human Rights in the Pursuit of Peace: A 20 Year Assessment	1092
	Note: Key Differences in Human Rights Policy Under Carter and Reagan	1095
	Jerome J. Shestack, An Unsteady Focus: The Vulnerabilities of the Reagan Administration's Human Rights Policy	1097
3.	Turning Down the Volume: The First President Bush	1098
	U.S. Institute for Peace, Human Rights and Peace: A 20 Year Assessment	1098
4.	Searching for a Policy: The Clinton Administration	1102
	Human Rights Policy Under the New Administration, Statement of the Honorable Timothy E. Wirth, Counselor, U.S. Department of State	1103
	John Shattuck, Human Rights and Democracy in Asia	1104
	Mary McGrory, Human Rights Retreat	1107
5.	National Security, Regime Change, and Human Rights: George W. Bush	1109
	Assistant Secretary of State for Democracy, Human Rights and Labor Lorne W. Craner, Supporting Human Rights and Democracy: The U.S. Record 2003-2004	1109
	Don Feder, Human Rights Not a Foreign Policy Concern	1111
	Michael Ignatieff, Is the Human Rights Era Ending?	1112
	Comments and Questions	1114
C.	U.S. Foreign Policy, Human Rights, and Relations with China	1115
	1. The United States Evaluates the World: The State Department's Annual Reports on Human Rights	1115
	U.S. State Department, Country Reports on Human Rights Practices: China	1115
	China Lashes Out at Human Rights Report	1119
	Information Office of the State Council of the People's Republic of China, The Human Rights Record of the United States in 2004	1120

2.	Multilateral Diplomacy at the UN Human Rights Commission	1124
	Note verbale dated 14 March 2005 from the Permanent Mission of Cuba to the United Nations Office at Geneva addressed to the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights	1126
3.	Linkages and Conditionality: Using U.S. Economic and Political Power	1129
	Remarks by Gov. William Clinton, A Vision for Democracy	1129
	President's News Conference (May 26, 1994)	1130
	Editorial, Speak Louder on Rights in China	1134
	Director of the State Department's Policy Planning Staff Richard N. Haass, China and the Future of U.S. – China Relations	1135
	George Kourous and Tom Barry, U.S. China Policy: Trade, Aid, and Human Rights	1139
	William H. Overholt, Be Tougher on Burma Than China Comments and Questions	1141
	Comments and Questions	1143
II.	<i>Human Rights Policies of Other States</i>	1144
A.	The European Union	1144
	European Union, Guidelines on Human Rights Dialogues	1146
B.	Japan	1149
	Yozo Yokota and Chiyuki Aoi, Japan's Foreign Policy towards Human Rights: Uncertain Changes	1149
	Japan, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Human Rights Pamphlet	1159
	Statement by H.E. Ambassador Shigeru Endo, Delegation of Japan, on Agenda Item 9: Question of the Violation of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms in Any Part of the World	1160
	Comments and Questions	1161
II.	<i>Final Comments and Questions</i>	1162
	<i>Index</i>	1165