## How Interpretation Makes International Law

On Semantic Change and Normative Twists

**INGO VENZKE** 



## Contents

| Table of Cases List of Abbreviations |  | xvii  |
|--------------------------------------|--|-------|
|                                      |  | xxiii |
| I.                                   | In the Beginning was the Deed                                    | 1     |
|                                      | Problématique  | 2     |
|                                      | Agenda   | 10    |
|                                      | Programme  | 14    |
| II.                                  | The Practice of Interpretation: A Theoretical Perspective        | 16    |
|                                      | A. Lawmaking in communicative practice                           | 18    |
|                                      | 1. On the sources of international law                           | 19    |
|                                      | 2. Sovereignty, sources, and semantic change                     | 27    |
|                                      | 3. From sources to communicative practice                        | 29    |
|                                      | B. Semantic struggles in the practice of legal interpretation    | 37    |
|                                      | 1. Practice between agency and structure                         | 38    |
|                                      | 2. On the form and substance of legal interpretation             | 46    |
|                                      | 3. Power and authority in semantic struggles                     | 57    |
|                                      | C. Actors in the practice of interpretation                      | 64    |
|                                      | 1. Private norm entrepreneurs                                    | 65    |
|                                      | 2. The disaggregated state                                       | 67    |
|                                      | 3. International institutions: Bureaucracies and judicial bodies | 69    |
| III.                                 | UNHCR and the Making of Refugee Law                              | 72    |
|                                      | A. International bureaucracies as actors in legal discourse      | 76    |
|                                      | 1. Delegation from principals to agents                          | 77    |
|                                      | 2. The authority of international bureaucracies                  | 82    |
|                                      | B. The expansion of UNHCR's Statute                              | 87    |
|                                      | 1. Expectations and concerns                                     | 90    |
|                                      | 2. International protection and humble beginnings                | 95    |
|                                      | 3. Material assistance, good offices, and displaced persons      | 98    |
|                                      | 4. Humanitarian aid and voluntary repatriation                   | 104   |
|                                      | C. UNHCR and the meaning of the Convention                       | 109   |
|                                      | <ol> <li>UNHCR's role in developing the Convention</li> </ol>    | 110   |
|                                      | 2. Semantic change at work: Shifting elements in the             |       |
|                                      | meaning of 'refugee'   | 122   |
|                                      | D. Conclusions: Change and contexts                              | 130   |

xvi Contents

| TV   | Adjudication in the GATT/WTO: Making General                        |     |
|--|---|-----|
| 14.  | Exceptions in Trade Law   | 135 |
|  | A. International adjudicators as actors in legal discourse          | 139 |
|  | Historiography: Longing for international adjudication              | 140 |
|  | 2. Judicial decisions and precedents                                | 144 |
|  | 3. The GATT/WTO context   | 147 |
|  | B. Article XX in the era of the GATT                                | 150 |
|  | 1. General exceptions: A general prologue                           | 150 |
|  | 2. The creation of a high threshold                                 | 157 |
|  | 3. A territorial limitation?  | 163 |
|  | C. Article XX in the era of the WTO                                 | 167 |
|  | Institutional changes and the working of precedents                 | 167 |
|  | 2. A new beginning with the Appellate Body                          | 172 |
|  | 3. Proportionality, interpretation, and legitimacy                  | 180 |
|  | D. Conclusions: Adjudication, precedents, and legitimacy            | 190 |
| V.   | Creative Interpretations: Normative Twists                          | 196 |
| ٠.   | A. The bittersweet taste of justice in legal discourse              | 198 |
|  | Narratives of progress and advents of justice                       | 200 |
|  | Scepticism and realism  | 207 |
|  | 3. The practice of interpretation and communicative action          | 214 |
|  | B. The centrality of law: Dissonances and developments in           |     |
|  |   | 223 |
|  | legal doctrine  1. The appeal and futility of soft law              | 225 |
|  | 2. Intertemporal law and subsequent practice: shortening the leash? | 230 |
|  | Global administrative law and international public authority        | 240 |
|  | C. Evasive foundations: Semantic authority in a normative           |     |
|  |   | 245 |
|  | pluriverse 1. Principles of democracy and ultimate authority        | 248 |
|  | Architectural renovation and institutional design                   | 252 |
|  | 3. Attitudes and interpretation at critical junctures               | 256 |
| VI. Epilogue: In the End there is Eternity |   | 262 |
|  |   | 266 |
|  | bliography  | 313 |
| In   | dex   | 313 |