

THE HUMAN RIGHT TO WATER

A Legal Comparative Perspective
at the International, Regional
and Domestic Level

Jimena MURILLO CHÁVARRO



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

CONTENTS

<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xiii
<i>Table of Cases and Other Materials</i>	xv
<i>Table of Treaties and Other Instruments</i>	xxiii

Chapter 1.

General Introduction	1
1.1. Research questions	3
1.2. Methodology	4
1.3. Structure of the study	6

Chapter 2.

Emergence, Definition and Core Content of the Human Right to Water	7
2.1. Introduction	7
2.2. Emergence of the human right to water	8
2.3. Definition and core content of the human right to water	17
2.3.1. Elements of the Right to Water	19
2.3.1.1. Availability	19
2.3.1.2. Quality and acceptability	22
2.3.1.3. Accessibility	25
2.3.1.3.1. Information accessibility	25
2.3.1.3.2. Physical accessibility	25
2.3.1.3.3. Affordability	27
2.4. State's obligations concerning the human right to water	29
2.4.1. Typology of human rights obligations at national level	29
2.4.1.1. Obligation to respect	31
2.4.1.2. Obligation to protect	32
2.4.1.3. Obligation to fulfil	36
2.4.1.4. Core obligations	38
2.5. Conclusions	40

Chapter 3.

Recognition of the Human Right to Water at the International Level	43
3.1. Introduction	43
3.2. Recognition of the right to water	44

3.2.1. Implicit recognition of the right to water	44	3.3.2.2. Individual communications under the Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	113
3.2.1.1. Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948)	44	3.3.2.3. Individual communications under the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women	114
3.2.1.2. International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (1966)	46	3.3.2.4. Individual communications under the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities	114
3.2.1.3. International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (1966)	48	3.4. Independent right to water in customary international law?	115
3.2.2. Explicit recognition of the right to water	54	3.5. Conclusions	125
3.2.2.1. Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (1979)	55	Chapter 4.	
3.2.2.2. Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989)	58	Recognition of the Human Right to Water at the Regional Level	127
3.2.2.3. Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (2006)	60	4.1. Introduction	127
3.2.2.4. Reports, guidelines, and studies on the right to water within the UN bodies	65	4.2. European human rights system and UNECE	130
3.2.2.5. UN General Assembly Resolutions	69	4.2.1. Recognition of the right to water at the European level in regional declarations, statements, resolutions and action plans	131
3.2.3. Interaction between soft law and hard law instruments	72	4.2.1.1. Council of Europe	131
3.3. Implementation of the right to water in international human rights law	73	4.2.1.2. United Nations Economic Commission for Europe	134
3.3.1. Reporting under universal human rights conventions	74	4.2.2. Recognition of the right to water in conventions adopted at the European level	136
3.3.1.1. Reporting under the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	77	4.2.2.1. European Convention on Human Rights	137
3.3.1.1.1. Functioning	77	4.2.2.2. European Social Charter (Revised)	137
3.3.1.1.2. Practice	78	4.2.2.3. The European Convention on the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman and Degrading Treatment or Punishment	139
3.3.1.2. Reporting under the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	84	4.2.2.4. Protocol on Water and Health to the 1992 Convention on the Protection and Use of Transboundary Watercourses and International Lakes	140
3.3.1.2.1. Functioning	84	4.3. Inter-American human rights system	142
3.3.1.2.2. Practice	86	4.3.1. Recognition of the right to water in regional declarations, statements, resolutions and action plans	146
3.3.1.3. Reporting under the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women	94	4.3.2. Recognition of the right to water in conventions adopted under the Inter-American system	148
3.3.1.3.1. Functioning	94	4.4. African human rights system	149
3.3.1.3.2. Practice	94	4.4.1. Recognition of the right to water in regional declarations, statements, resolutions and action plans	151
3.3.1.4. Reporting under the Convention on the Rights of the Child	99	4.4.2. Recognition of the right to water in conventions adopted under the African system	152
3.3.1.4.1. Functioning	99	4.4.2.1. African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights	153
3.3.1.4.2. Practice	100		
3.3.1.5. Reporting under the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities	105		
3.3.1.5.1. Functioning	105		
3.3.1.5.2. Practice	105		
3.3.2. Contentious cases under universal human rights conventions	109		
3.3.2.1. Individual communications under the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	111		

4.4.2.2. Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa.....	153
4.4.2.3. African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child	153
4.5. Implementation of the right to water in regional human rights law....	154
4.5.1. Contentious procedures under regional human rights instruments	155
4.5.1.1. European human rights system	155
4.5.1.1.1. Cruel inhumane or degrading treatment	155
4.5.1.1.2. Right to respect for private and family life ...	158
4.5.1.1.3. Right to fair trial (right to property)	163
4.5.1.1.4. Right to housing	164
4.5.1.2. Inter-American human rights system.....	168
4.5.1.2.1. Cruel inhuman or degrading treatment	168
4.5.1.2.2. Right to life.....	175
4.5.1.3. African human rights system.....	182
4.5.1.3.1. Right to dignity (cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment)	183
4.5.1.3.2. Right to health.....	184
4.5.1.3.3. Right to a healthy environment	187
4.5.1.3.4. Right to development	188
4.6. Independent right to water in regional customary law?	190
4.7. Conclusions.....	195

Chapter 5.

Recognition of the Human Right to Water at the Domestic Level:

a Case Study Approach	199
5.1. Introduction	199
5.2. Recognition of the human right to water in national legal systems	201
5.2.1. Argentina	201
5.2.1.1. Recognition of the right to water	203
5.2.1.2. Mechanisms to protect the right to water.....	206
5.2.2. Chile	207
5.2.2.1. Recognition of the right to water	213
5.2.2.2. Mechanisms to protect the right to water.....	215
5.2.3. Colombia.....	218
5.2.3.1. Recognition of the right to water	220
5.2.3.2. Mechanisms to protect the right to water.....	223
5.2.4. Bolivia.....	226
5.2.4.1. Cochabamba and the water war.....	230
5.2.4.2. Recognition of the right to water	234
5.2.4.3. Mechanisms to protect the right to water.....	236

5.3. Implementation of the right to water at domestic level.....	239
5.3.1. Contentious cases in domestic courts	240
5.3.1.1. Argentina	241
5.3.1.1.1. Access to water	241
5.3.1.1.2. Availability and disconnection of water services	244
5.3.1.1.3. Economic access	248
5.3.1.1.4. Water quality	252
5.3.1.1.5. Public participation	254
5.3.1.2. Chile	255
5.3.1.2.1. Access to water	255
5.3.1.2.2. Availability and disconnection of water service.....	257
5.3.1.2.3. Economic access	259
5.3.1.2.4. Water quality	261
5.3.1.3. Colombia	262
5.3.1.3.1. Access to water	262
5.3.1.3.2. Availability and disconnection of water services.....	263
5.3.1.3.3. Economic access	266
5.3.1.3.4. Water quality	269
5.3.1.4. Bolivia.....	270
5.3.1.4.1. Access to water	270
5.3.1.4.2. Availability and disconnection of drinking water services	271
5.3.1.4.3. Economic access	274
5.3.1.4.4. Water quality	275
5.4. Independent right at the domestic level?	275
5.5. Conclusions.....	278

Chapter 6.

Extraterritorial Application of the Human Right to Water in a

Transboundary Watercourse Context	283
6.1. Introduction	283
6.2. Typology of human rights obligations at the international level.....	284
6.2.1. Legal basis for the international human rights obligations of the economic, social and cultural rights.....	285
6.2.1.1. The UN Charter	286
6.2.1.2. Universal Declaration on Human Rights.....	288
6.2.1.3. International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	289

6.2.2. Authoritative interpretation of the CESCR concerning international obligations	293
6.2.2.1. International obligation to respect	295
6.2.2.2. International obligation to protect	296
6.2.2.3. International obligation to fulfil	297
6.3. The human right to water in a transboundary watercourse context....	299
6.3.1. Extraterritorial causes that impact the human right to water ...	300
6.3.2. International water law as the legal framework for cooperation in the management and use of transboundary watercourses.....	302
6.3.2.1. Principle of equitable and reasonable utilisation of waters.....	302
6.3.2.2. The no significant harm rule	307
6.3.2.3. The obligation to cooperate.....	311
6.3.3. Are international obligations on the human right to water conflicting with the principles of international water law?	312
6.3.4. Remedies.....	323
6.3.4.1. Mechanisms used by states.....	323
6.3.4.1.1. Inter-state mechanisms in international water law.....	323
6.3.4.1.2. Inter-state mechanisms in human rights law	325
6.3.4.2. Actions initiated by individuals against foreign states	331
6.3.4.2.1. Individual complaints under international water law.....	331
6.3.4.2.2. Individual complaints under human rights law	335
6.4. Conclusions.....	337
 Chapter 7.	
General Conclusions	341
7.1 Recognition of the human right to water under human rights law.....	341
7.2. Extraterritorial application of the human right to water and its relationship with international water law	348
7.3. Overall conclusion.....	353
 <i>Bibliography</i>	355
<i>Index</i>	377