

# SUPREME COURT : EXPOUNDING TRANSFORMATIVE JURISPRUDENCE IN INDIA

The Genesis of Law, Justice and Morality

**PROFESSOR DR. K.L. BHATIA**

B.A. (Hons.) (J&K); LL.B. (ILS Pune University); LL.M., Ph. D. (Pune)  
DAAD and Max-Planck Fellow and Alumni

Presently Professor in Law, National Law University, Jodhpur  
(Former Head, Dean and Founding Director, The Law School, Faculty of Law,  
University of Jammu; Director Amity Law School;  
Dean and Professor Emeritus, University of Petroleum and Energy Studies;  
UNDP Professor Public Law)

*Assisted by*

**MANU BHATIA SHARMA**

BSL LL.B. (ILS Pune University), LL.M. (GND University);  
ICRC, Henry Dunant and Max-Planck Fellow, Research Scholar

*Foreword*

**JUSTICE DR. A.S. ANAND**

Former Chief Justice of India and Chairman National Human Rights Commission

*Afterword*

**JUSTICE N.N. MATHUR**

Former Judge, Rajasthan and Gujarat High Courts and  
Vice Chancellor, National Law University, Jodhpur



**REGAL PUBLICATIONS**

New Delhi - 110 027

# Contents

Preface	xi
Foreword	xvii
Table of Cases	xxi
<b>I. INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>1</b>
Introduction	1
Justice and Expounding Philosophy	2
The Expounding Philosophy of the Textual Constitution of India 'Flashing the Flaming Sword of Its Inspiration'	5
Judicial Governance—Supreme Court Collegium and Juristocracy	6
Legal Profession—Integrating Human Values and Professional Ethics	20
Judiciary <i>v.</i> Parliament—Judicial Remonstrance	21
Judiciary Not Corrupt But For Aberration	21
The Problems the Indian Judiciary Faces—Delay and Clogging the Courts with Arrears	21
Public Interest Litigation—Judicial Legislation Not a Myth but a Reality	24
Undertrials without Trials	24
Judiciary and National Interest	25
Judiciary and Gender Justice	25
Conclusion	27
<b>2. INVISIBLE STATE : THE PUZZLE OF HIDE AND SEEK?</b>	<b>34</b>
Introduction	34
Conceptual Analysis of Invisible State	35
Contours of Judicial Policy—Judicial Activism and Social Change	36
A Rarest Example of Invisible State Meddling with the Constitution Where It Has No Constitutional Mandate:	
Article 35A : A Mishmash of the Textual Constitution of India!	37

<b>3. ADMINISTRATIVE PROCESS : NATURE AND SCOPE OF ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION AND JUDICIAL REVIEW</b>	<b>46</b>
Administrative Action: Administrative, Ministerial and Judicial Functions: Distinction	48
Natural Justice	50
Delegated Legislation	55
Judicial Review	64
Tortious and Contractual Liability	80
Authorities or Regulatory Authorities under Customs Act, Taxation Laws and Other Laws: Rules of Classification; Fair Hearing; Terms of Art. and Related Terms	84
<b>4. ALTERNATIVE DISPUTES RESOLUTION MECHANISMS : ARBITRAL PROCESS THROUGH ARBITRATION, CONCILIATION AND MEDIATION</b>	<b>103</b>
<b>5. CONSTITUTIONAL LAW</b>	<b>120</b>
Conceptual Framework of Fundamental Rights, Directive Principles of State Policy and Fundamental Duties: Jural Postulates—Correlatives and Opposite State	126
Separation of Powers	128
Disciplining the Subordinate Judiciary	135
Relationship Between Supreme Court and High Courts	141
Rights to Equality, Life and Liberty and Necessity of Principle of Classification	144
(a) Reservation of Seats in Super-specialised Courses in Medical Institutions: Mediocracy <i>versus</i> Meritocracy	148
(b) Affirmative Action and Reservation Policy in Educational Institutions: Minority and Non-minority	152
Public Interest Litigation	157
Slaughter of the Cow and Cow Progeny—The Genesis of Protection in the Interest of Agrarian Economy as a Source for Non-conventional Energy	166
Right to Freedom and Reasonable Restrictions	174
Population Control and National Interest	186
Right to Privacy—Proportionality of Procedure	187
Sati Prevention Law—Glorification of Sati and Rule against Double Jeopardy	189
Delay in Disposal of Cases: Could there be Directions Prescribing Time-limit for Speedy Trial?	194
Shatrughan Chauhan <i>versus</i> Union of India, 2014, A Highly Valued Articulation of the Supreme Court	195
	199

Environment Pollution <i>vis-à-vis</i> Right to Life with Human Dignity	211
Doctrine of Merger and Right of Review	215
Teenaged Students' Right to Education: Jawahar Navodaya Vidyalaya	218
Maintainability of Writ under Article 226	220
Rule of Stare Decisis: Articles 141 and 145—Supreme Court <i>v.</i> Supreme Court	223
Test of Reasonable Classification—Rationale	224
Doctrine of Priority or Precedence of State Debts—Rule of Necessity and Public Policy	226
Public Distribution System—Constitutionality of Essential Commodities Law	227
Electricity Energy, What it is and What its Characteristics are; What is Inter-State Sale	228
Doctrine of Occupied Field—Per curiam—Resolution of Conflict between Union and State Legislation	229
The Novartis Case: Constitutional Savior of Economic Unity and Fiscal Integration and Social Rights of Citizens—A Perception	242
<b>6. AFTERWORD</b>	<b>271</b>
Bibliography	286
Index	290