

# VIRTUAL CURRENCIES

## A Legal Framework

Niels VANDEZANDE



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

**KU LEUVEN**

**CITIP**

CENTRE FOR IT & IP LAW

# CONTENTS

<i>Foreword</i> .....	v
<i>Acknowledgments</i> .....	ix
<i>Acronyms</i> .....	xxi
<b>Introduction</b> .....	1
1 Background of the research .....	1
2 Problem statement and state of the art .....	2
2.1 Legal uncertainty .....	2
2.2 Regulatory inaction .....	4
2.3 Stakeholder risks .....	5
3 Research objective .....	6
4 Research questions .....	7
5 Relevance of the research .....	10
6 Methodology and structure .....	12
6.1 Typology, terminology, and interdisciplinary research .....	12
6.2 Supportive trust analysis .....	14
6.3 Money and virtual currencies .....	16
6.4 Fundamental analysis and critical assessment .....	17
6.5 Functional comparison .....	19
6.6 Integration, final assessment and recommendations .....	20
<b>PART I CONCEPTUAL ANALYSIS</b> .....	23
<b>Chapter I</b>	
<b>Typology and Terminology of Virtual Currencies</b> .....	25
1 Introduction .....	25
2 Terminology of virtual currencies .....	26
2.1 Virtual currencies in the EU .....	26
2.2 Why 'virtual currencies'? .....	29
2.2.1 'Digital', 'electronic', or 'virtual'? .....	29
2.2.2 'Cash', 'currency', 'money', or none of the above? .....	32
2.3 Defining virtual currencies .....	35
3 Practical examples .....	38
3.1 Loyalty programs .....	38
3.1.1 Classic loyalty point programs .....	39

3.1.2	Mobile platforms	40
3.1.3	Frequent-flyer programs	41
3.2	In-game currencies	42
3.2.1	Pay-to-play	42
3.2.2	Free-to-play	45
3.2.3	Second Life	47
3.3	Prepaid value currencies	49
3.4	Cryptocurrencies	50
3.4.1	Background	51
3.4.2	Technical aspects	54
3.4.2.1	Wallets and addresses	54
3.4.2.2	Transactions	55
3.4.2.3	Confirmation and blockchain	56
3.4.2.4	Mining	59
3.4.2.5	Other applications	61
3.4.3	Economic aspects	63
3.4.3.1	Economics of cryptocurrencies	63
3.4.3.2	Cryptocurrencies and fractional-reserve banking	66
3.4.3.3	Mining risk	68
4	Typology	70
4.1	The ECB's typology of virtual currencies	70
4.1.1	Closed schemes	70
4.1.2	Unidirectional schemes	71
4.1.3	Bidirectional schemes	72
4.2	Application of typology to practical examples	73
4.2.1	Loyalty programs	73
4.2.2	In-game currencies	74
4.2.3	Prepaid value currencies	75
4.2.4	Cryptocurrencies	75
4.3	Alternative typology	76
5	Risk analysis	78
5.1	User risks	79
5.2	Market risks	81
5.3	Investor risks	82
5.4	Service provider risks	83
5.5	Risks and typology	84
6	Interim conclusions	85

## Chapter II

Elements of Trust	89
1 Introduction	89

2	The abstract notion of 'trust'	90
2.1	Philosophy	91
2.2	Psychology	93
2.3	Sociology	93
2.4	Economy	96
2.5	Computer science and engineering	98
2.6	Law	103
2.7	Synthesis	109
2.8	Trust in modern society	110
3	Trust operationalization through law	112
3.1	Trust services in the EU	112
3.1.1	E-Signatures Directive	113
3.1.2	eIDAS Regulation	118
3.1.3	Synthesis	122
3.2	Other forms of trust operationalization through law	123
3.2.1	Trusted service providers at the EU Member States' level	123
3.2.2	Trusted custodian	125
3.2.3	Trust through consumer law	128
3.2.4	Trust through financial law	131
3.2.5	Synthesis	132
4	Interim conclusions	133

## Chapter III

Perspectives of Money	137
1 Introduction	137
2 Money as a legal concept	138
3 Theories on money	141
3.1 The credit theory and the origins of money	141
3.2 State theory	143
3.3 Role of the state in money creation	146
3.4 Functional theories	150
3.5 Amended state theory	152
4 Functions of money	154
4.1 Medium of exchange	154
4.2 Unit of account	155
4.3 Store of value	156
5 Virtual currencies as money	157
5.1 Virtual currencies and theories on money	157
5.2 Virtual currencies and functions of money	160
6 Interim conclusions	162

PART II LEGAL ANALYSIS.....	165
Chapter IV	
E-Money and Payment Services in the EU.....	167
1 Introduction .....	167
1.1 Virtual currencies, e-money, and payment services.....	167
1.2 E-money and payment services in the EU.....	169
2 E-money.....	171
2.1 Regulatory background.....	171
2.1.1 E-money before 2000 .....	172
2.1.1.1 Working Group on EU Payment Systems 1994 .....	172
2.1.1.2 EMI Council opinion 1997.....	177
2.1.1.3 ECB report 1998.....	179
2.1.1.4 EC proposal and explanatory memorandum 1998 .....	182
2.1.1.5 ECB opinion 1999 .....	186
2.1.1.6 Economic and Social Committee opinion 1999 ..	188
2.1.1.7 European Parliament first reading 1999 .....	189
2.1.1.8 Council common position 1999 .....	192
2.1.1.9 Further procedure 2000 .....	193
2.1.1.10 Findings.....	194
2.1.2 First E-money Directive.....	196
2.1.2.1 Directive .....	196
2.1.2.2 DG Internal Market Consultation Paper.....	198
2.1.2.3 Implementation in Member States .....	200
2.1.2.4 Review .....	203
2.1.3 Second E-money Directive.....	209
2.1.3.1 Directive .....	209
2.1.3.2 Implementation in the Member States .....	211
2.1.3.3 Review .....	212
2.1.4 Evaluation.....	213
2.2 E-money scope .....	214
2.2.1 Definition .....	214
2.2.1.1 Electronically, including magnetically, stored value .....	214
2.2.1.2 Represented by a claim on the issuer .....	216
2.2.1.3 Issued on receipt of funds for making payment transactions .....	217
2.2.1.4 Accepted by institutions other than their issuer .....	219
2.2.2 Redeemability .....	220

2.3 E-money and virtual currencies .....	222
2.3.1 Closed scheme virtual currencies.....	222
2.3.2 Unidirectional scheme virtual currencies.....	222
2.3.3 Bidirectional scheme virtual currencies .....	224
2.3.4 Evaluation.....	225
3 Payment services .....	226
3.1 Regulatory background.....	226
3.1.1 Before 2007.....	227
3.1.1.1 Early stages .....	227
3.1.1.2 Proposal PSD1 .....	228
3.1.1.3 European Central Bank Opinion .....	230
3.1.1.4 European Economic and Social Committee Opinion .....	231
3.1.1.5 Council negotiations.....	232
3.1.1.6 European Parliament adoption .....	233
3.1.2 First Payment Services Directive .....	234
3.1.3 Review.....	237
3.1.3.1 Implementation, green paper, and consultation ..	237
3.1.3.2 Proposal PSD2 .....	239
3.1.3.3 European Economic and Social Committee Opinion .....	242
3.1.3.4 European Central Bank Opinion .....	243
3.1.3.5 European Parliament Committee Stage – First attempt .....	243
3.1.3.6 Council General Approach.....	244
3.1.3.7 European Parliament Committee Stage – Second attempt and adoption .....	245
3.1.4 Second Payment Services Directive .....	245
3.1.5 Evaluation.....	248
3.2 Payment services scope .....	249
3.2.1 Positive scope .....	249
3.2.2 Scope exemptions .....	256
3.2.2.1 Added value exemption.....	256
3.2.2.2 Limited network exemption.....	258
3.2.2.3 Money exchange exemption.....	260
3.3 Payment services and virtual currencies .....	261
3.3.1 Closed scheme virtual currencies.....	261
3.3.2 Unidirectional scheme virtual currencies.....	261
3.3.3 Bidirectional scheme virtual currencies .....	262
3.3.3.1 General remarks.....	262
3.3.3.2 Member States' opinions.....	263
3.3.3.3 European Commission's opinion .....	265

3.3.3.4	Exemptions .....	266
3.3.3.5	Additional remark .....	266
3.3.4	Evaluation .....	267
4	Toward a unified framework? .....	267
5	Interim conclusions .....	271
5.1	Findings .....	272
5.2	Normative assessment .....	274

## Chapter V

<b>Anti-Money Laundering in the EU .....</b>		<b>277</b>
1	Introduction .....	277
2	Money laundering and the EU directives .....	278
2.1	The concept of money laundering .....	278
2.2	Road to Anti-Money Laundering Directive 4 .....	279
3	Fourth Anti-Money Laundering Directive .....	281
3.1	Proposal Fourth Anti-Money Laundering Directive .....	281
3.2	Fourth Anti-Money Laundering Directive .....	284
4	Amendments to Fourth Anti-Money Laundering Directive .....	286
4.1	Commission proposal and legislative procedure .....	286
4.2	Virtual currencies .....	289
4.3	Virtual currency service providers .....	292
5	Virtual currencies under anti-money laundering rules .....	294
5.1	Virtual currencies as money laundering tool .....	294
5.2	Virtual currency service providers until AMLD4 .....	298
5.3	Virtual currency service providers after AMLD4 amendments .....	303
6	Interim conclusions .....	307
6.1	Findings .....	307
6.2	Normative assessment .....	308

## Chapter VI

<b>Financial Instruments in the EU .....</b>		<b>311</b>
1	Introduction .....	311
2	Regulatory background .....	313
2.1	Before 2004 .....	313
2.2	First Markets in Financial Instruments Directive .....	315
2.3	Markets in Financial Instruments Regulation and Second Directive .....	316
3	Financial instruments scope .....	317
3.1	Personal scope of MiFID1 and 2 .....	317
3.2	Material scope of MiFID1 and 2 – investment services .....	318
3.3	Material scope of MiFID1 and 2 – financial instruments .....	318

4	Markets in financial instruments and virtual currencies .....	321
4.1	Closed scheme virtual currencies .....	321
4.2	Unidirectional scheme virtual currencies .....	322
4.3	Bidirectional scheme virtual currencies .....	323
4.3.1	Cryptocurrencies intended as means of payment .....	323
4.3.1.1	EU perspective .....	323
4.3.1.2	Member State deviation: Germany .....	326
4.3.2	Cryptocurrencies intended as means of investment .....	329
4.3.2.1	EU perspective .....	329
4.3.2.2	Member State case: Belgium .....	332
A.	Investment instruments .....	332
B.	Crowdfunding .....	334
5	Interim conclusions .....	336
5.1	Findings .....	336
5.2	Normative assessment .....	337

## Chapter VII

<b>Virtual Currencies and Service Providers in the US .....</b>		<b>341</b>
1	Introduction .....	341
2	Methodology .....	342
3	US regulatory frameworks .....	343
3.1	Money .....	343
3.1.1	Constitution .....	343
3.1.2	Stamp Payments Act 1862 .....	344
3.1.3	Counterfeiting statutes .....	346
3.1.4	Application to virtual currencies .....	347
3.2	Payments .....	349
3.2.1	Electronic Fund Transfer Act 1978 .....	349
3.2.2	Uniform Commercial Code .....	351
3.2.3	Application to virtual currencies .....	353
3.3	Anti-money laundering .....	354
3.3.1	Bank Secrecy Act 1970 .....	355
3.3.2	Money Laundering Control Act 1986 .....	362
3.3.3	State regulation .....	364
3.3.3.1	Uniform Money Services Act .....	364
3.3.3.2	California .....	366
3.3.3.3	Virginia .....	367
3.3.4	Application to virtual currencies .....	367
3.4	Investments .....	368
3.4.1	Securities regulation .....	369
3.4.1.1	Overview .....	369
3.4.1.2	Notes .....	370

3.4.1.3	Stock .....	372
3.4.1.4	Investment contracts .....	373
3.4.1.5	Currency .....	379
3.4.2	Derivatives regulation .....	380
3.4.3	State regulation .....	384
3.4.3.1	Blue sky laws and federal preemption .....	384
3.4.3.2	Uniform Securities Act .....	385
3.4.3.3	State commodity laws .....	386
3.4.4	Application to virtual currencies .....	387
4	Legislative developments .....	390
4.1	Federal level .....	390
4.2	Uniform Regulation of Virtual Currency Businesses Act .....	392
4.3	California .....	396
4.4	Delaware .....	400
4.5	New Hampshire .....	401
4.6	New York .....	403
5	Interim conclusions .....	407
5.1	Findings .....	407
5.2	Normative assessment .....	410
PART III CONCLUSION .....		413

### Chapter VIII

#### Integration, assessment, conclusions, and recommendations .....

1	Integration of research findings .....	415
1.1	Virtual currencies as money .....	416
1.2	Virtual currencies under e-money and payment services .....	417
1.3	Virtual currencies under anti-money laundering .....	419
1.4	Virtual currencies and investment services .....	420
1.5	Findings .....	421
2	In need of regulation? .....	422
2.1	Preliminary assessments .....	423
2.1.1	E-money and payment services .....	423
2.1.2	Anti-money laundering .....	424
2.1.3	Investment services .....	424
2.1.4	Findings .....	425
2.2	Regulatory need .....	426
2.2.1	Risk pertinence .....	427
2.2.2	Changing virtual currency landscape .....	427
2.2.3	Objectives of financial law frameworks .....	431
2.2.4	Desirability of regulation .....	433
3	Conclusion .....	437

4	Recommendations .....	441
4.1	Merchants and users of virtual currencies .....	441
4.2	Virtual currency service providers and issuers .....	441
4.3	Legislators and regulators .....	442
<i>Bibliography</i> .....		445