

# **GLOBAL ENVIRONMENTAL LAW**

by  
Ricardo Luis Lorenzetti  
and  
Pablo Lorenzetti

ENVIRONMENTAL LAW INSTITUTE  
Washington, D.C.

# Contents

About the Authors.....	xvii
Acknowledgements.....	xvii
Theme One: The Environmental Rule of Law.....	1
Chapter I: The Environmental Paradigm .....	1
Introduction—Utopian, Analytical, and Paradigmatic Phase .....	2
Part One—Nature as a Scarce Resource.....	3
I. Nature as Fragile and in Need of Protection .....	4
II. Nature as a Scarce Resource .....	4
III. Data on the Environmental Crisis .....	5
1. Homogeneity Makes Progress Over Diversity.....	5
2. Pollution Spreads .....	7
3. Imbalance Displaces Balance .....	10
4. Acceleration Displaces Foresight.....	11
Part Two—Conflict and False Dilemmas.....	13
I. Declaratory Consensus and Practical Dissent .....	13
II. Intergenerational Conflict .....	15
III. Intragenerational Conflict .....	17
IV. Equality vs. Environment.....	18
V. Development vs. Environment.....	19
VI. Irresolvable Conflicts and Polarisation.....	20
Part Three—The Environmental Paradigm.....	22
I. Need for an Environmental Paradigm.....	22
II. The Notion of System .....	23
III. The Notion of Collective Action .....	25
IV. The Anthropocentric and Geocentric Model.....	26
V. Communicability With the Principles of Nature.....	27
1. Resilience.....	28
2. Biophilia .....	29
3. Cooperation.....	30

VI. Governance: Rigidity vs. Flexibility.....	30
VII. Conflicts in the Intimate, Private, and Social Sphere.....	32
VIII. The Economy .....	34
1. Negative Externalities: The Company's Relationship With Society.....	34
2. Institutions: The Tragedy of the Common Goods.....	36
3. Positive Externalities. New Economic Fields .....	38
IX. Ethics and Values.....	39
1. Values: Liberty, Equality, and Fraternity .....	39
2. Fraternity vs. Individual Interests.....	40
X. Conclusion.....	42
Chapter II: The Environmental Rule of Law.....	45
I. Introduction: Two Facets .....	45
II. The Rule of Law Paradox.....	46
III. Fundamental Environmental Rights .....	47
IV. Access to Justice .....	48
V. Access to Information and Participation .....	49
1. Access to Information.....	52
2. Principle of Participation .....	54
VI. The Progressiveness of Fundamental Rights and the Regression of Environmental Law.....	55
VII. The Principle of Protection .....	55
VIII. Conclusion.....	56
Theme Two: Environmental Law.....	57
Chapter III: Legal Goods .....	57
Introduction .....	58
Part One—Environmental Legal Good .....	59
I. Collective Good Positioned in the Social Sphere .....	59
1. Indivisibility of Benefits: The Good Cannot Be Divided Among Those Who Use It .....	59
2. Sustainable Common Use: The Good May Be Used by All Citizens.....	59

3.	Non-Exclusion of Beneficiaries: All Individuals Have Usage Rights and Thus Cannot Be Excluded.....	60
4.	Regulatory Status: The Collective Good Is Legally Recognised.....	60
5.	Objective Classification: A Good Is Classified as Collective by a Regulatory Designation That Is Objective as Opposed to Subjective .....	60
6.	Diffuse or Collective Standing to Sue: These Goods Are Protected by a Broad Standing to Sue.....	61
7.	Precedence of Preventive Protection: To Protect These Goods, Prevention and Precaution Must Take Priority Over Reparation.....	61
8.	Compensation Through Patrimonies of Affectation: When There Is Redress, There Is No Compensation That Is Transferred to the Assets of an Individual, Even if They Have Locus Standi.....	62
9.	Position in the Social Sphere: These Goods Belong to the Social Protection Sphere.....	62
II.	Duties, Limits, and Typical Fundamental Rights.....	62
III.	Notion of Environment .....	64
Part Two—	The Environment and Actions .....	66
I.	Actions According to Conflicts .....	66
II.	The Legal Definition of Rights.....	69
1.	Outline .....	69
2.	Rights Over Individual Legal Goods.....	71
3.	Rights Over Common Legal Goods .....	72
4.	Rights Over Homogeneous Individual Interests .....	72
III.	Civil and Commercial Code of Argentina.....	73
Part Three—	Nature as a Subject.....	75
Chapter IV:	Principles and Directives.....	79
I.	Introduction.....	80
II.	Legal Definition of Principles and Values .....	80
1.	Principles .....	80
2.	Values .....	82

III.	Acceptance in Environmental Law .....	82
1.	International Sources .....	82
2.	Argentine Law .....	85
3.	Legal Effects .....	85
IV.	Description of Environmental Principles.....	86
1.	Principle of Consistency .....	87
a)	Enunciation and Effects .....	87
b)	Consistency in Terms of Procedural Rule.....	88
2.	Principle of Prevention .....	89
3.	Precautionary Principle .....	90
4.	Principle of Progressivity.....	91
5.	Principle of Responsibility .....	92
6.	Principle of Subsidiarity.....	93
7.	Principle of Sustainability .....	93
8.	Principle of Intergenerational Equity .....	95
9.	Principle of Solidarity .....	95
10.	Principle of Cooperation.....	96
11.	“In Dubio Pro Natura” .....	96
V.	Principle of Non-Regression.....	97
1.	The Regression of Environmental Law.....	97
2.	Principal Traits.....	98
3.	Principle of Progressivity.....	99
4.	Sustainable and Lasting Development .....	99
5.	Legal Effects .....	100
a)	Unjustifiably Regressive Law .....	101
b)	The Most Favourable Interpretation.....	101
c)	In Relation to Public Policy.....	102
Chapter V:	Principles of Prevention and Precaution .....	103
Introduction .....		104
I.	Emotional Consensus and Cognitive Dissent .....	107
II.	Interventionist, Preventive and Precautionary.....	109
III.	Precedents.....	110
IV.	Description .....	111

V. Questions.....	112
Part One—Legal Classification .....	113
I. Is It an Obligation or a Voluntary Option? .....	113
II. Are They Aimed at Civil Servants or do They Extend to Ordinary Citizens?.....	113
III. What Is Their Effect on Public Policy?.....	114
IV. What Is the Content of the Principle?.....	115
1. Constitutional Basis .....	115
2. Undetermined legal Description.....	115
3. Different Weighting Depending on the Goods Compromised .....	115
V. What Are the Premises for Application? .....	116
1. Threat of Serious or Irreversible Damage.....	116
2. Scientific Uncertainty.....	118
Part Two—Applying the Principle.....	120
I. It Is Case-Dependent.....	120
II. Reducing Uncertainty .....	121
III. Transferring the Risk of Doubt.....	121
IV. Transferring the Risk of Scientific Error. False Positives and False Negatives.....	122
V. Transferring the Risk in Delay.....	122
VI. Transferring Probative Risk.....	122
VII. Dynamic and Adaptive Application.....	123
VIII. Transferring Development Risk.....	123
IX. Equity and Non-Discrimination.....	124
Part Three—The Balance Between Risk And Benefit.....	125
I. Admissibility of the Risk-Benefit Balance.....	125
II. The Status of Non-Evaluative Procedural Technique .....	125
III. The Non-Emotional Analytical Method .....	125
IV. The Procedure .....	126
1. Identify Probability Margins .....	126
2. There Must Be an Evaluation of The Relative Benefits for the Relevant Parties .....	127

3.	There Must Be an Examination of the Comparative Costs of the Various Alternatives .....	127
4.	Previous Experiences Must Be Assessed to Ensure Consistency of Action .....	128
5.	Step-by-Step Experimentation .....	128
6.	Intra- and Intergenerational Comparisons .....	128
V.	Public Control .....	129
1.	The Process of Moral Deliberation .....	129
2.	The Crisis in Decision-Making Processes .....	130
3.	Intensive Democracy .....	130
VI.	Risk Control and Management .....	131
Part Four—	Paradigm Shifts .....	133
I.	Legal Security .....	134
II.	From Reparation to Anticipation .....	134
III.	The Anchor Paradigm .....	135
Chapter VI:	The Environmental Function .....	137
I.	Introduction .....	137
II.	Harmonisation Between Individual and Collective Rights .....	139
1.	Framing the Conflict .....	139
2.	Reconciliation Rules in the Argentine Civil and Commercial Code .....	141
III.	Private Property .....	143
1.	Original Ethos .....	143
2.	Some Branches .....	144
IV.	The Contract .....	145
1.	Protecting Free Will and Individual Freedoms .....	145
2.	Influence of Public Policy and the Theory of Fundamental Rights in Contract Law .....	147
3.	Environmental Function of the Contract .....	149
V.	Sustainable Consumption .....	151
1.	Framing the Conflict .....	151
2.	Some Declarations .....	153

Chapter VII: The Regulation of Water and the Landscape .....	157
Part One—The Regulation of Water .....	159
I. Introduction.....	159
II. What <i>Was</i> Water for the Law? .....	160
1. The Ownership and Anthropocentric Model.....	160
2. Thing Liable to Appropriation: Res Commercium ..	160
3. Limits to Appropriation .....	161
4. Desacralisation of Water .....	161
5. The Environmental Issue Focused on Human Public Health.....	162
6. Independent Public and Private Spheres.....	163
7. Protected Legal Good .....	163
8. Types of Norms: Predominance of the Subjective Right .....	163
9. Legal Sources .....	164
III. What <i>Is</i> Water for the Law?.....	164
1. Awareness That Water Is a Scarce Resource .....	164
2. The Focus Shifts to Usage .....	164
3. The Imposition of Limits on Industrial Development and the Ownership Model .....	166
4. Regulatory Sources.....	167
a) Constitution.....	167
b) Special Legislation.....	167
5. Type of Norms .....	168
6. Protected Legal Good .....	168
IV. What Will Happen?.....	168
1. Water as an Issue That Generates Legal Adjudication Models.....	168
2. Allocation Through the Market .....	170
a) Analogy Between Land and Water .....	170
b) Criticism of Socialism Over Land and Water....	170
3. The Water Ownership Rights Model .....	171
4. Individual Freedom and Ownership Must Be Respected.....	171



- 5. Criticism..... 172
- 6. Water as a Collective Good in the Social Sphere.... 172
- 7. Water as a Good Belonging to the Social or  
Collective Sphere ..... 172
- 8. Replacement of the Anthropocentric Model..... 173
- 9. Logical Hierarchy in the Clash of Rights..... 173
- 10. Environmental Function of Property Rights..... 174
- 11. Fundamental Right to Access Drinking Water ..... 174
- 12. Protected Goods and Types of Norm..... 174
- Part Two—The Atuel River Case..... 175
  - I. The Atuel River: An Introduction to the Case ..... 175
  - II. The Claim Brought by La Pampa in 2014 That  
Gives Rise to This Ruling..... 177
  - III. The Absolute Jurisdiction of the Court ..... 178
  - IV. Rejection of the Double Jeopardy Principle ..... 178
  - V. The Human Right to Access Drinking Water ..... 179
  - VI. The Fight Against Desertification in the Region..... 179
  - VII. The Holistic View of the River Basin..... 180
  - VIII. The Interprovincial Committee for the Lower Atuel  
(CIAI)..... 180
  - IX. Conclusion..... 181
- Part Three—Brasilia Declaration of Judges on Water Justice  
(Declaration Comprising 10 Principles). ..... 182
- Part Four—The Landscape: A Challenge in the Legal Theory  
of Environmental Law ..... 187
  - I. Reasons for Its Legal Relevance. Vulnerability of the  
Landscape..... 188
  - II. The First Regulatory Approaches ..... 188
    - 1. Neighbourly Relations..... 188
    - 2. Preservation of Historical and Cultural Urban  
Heritage..... 189
  - III. Legal Definitions of Landscape..... 189
    - 1. General Approximations..... 189
    - 2. Natural and Cultural Good..... 190

3.	It Is an Environmental Sub-System of a Relational Nature .....	191
4.	Landscape, Environment, and Biodiversity .....	191
5.	Delimiting the Landscape: Spatial-Temporal Difficulties .....	191
6.	Landscape and Heritage .....	192
7.	Subjective and Objective Dimension: Social Concept of Landscape .....	193
8.	Conclusions .....	193
IV.	Case Law .....	194
1.	Aesthetic Values of a Park. Failure of the State to Provide Protection .....	194
2.	Construction of a Pelota Court That Blights the Neighbourhood .....	195
3.	Construction of a Tower That Affects the Appearance of a Historic Monument .....	196
4.	Works That Impact on Historical and Cultural Memory .....	196
5.	The Wall That Impedes the View of the Sea .....	197
6.	Work That Reduces the Value of Property by Affecting the View of the River .....	198
7.	Overhead Power Cables That Affect the Mountain Landscape .....	198
8.	From the Case Law of Oaxaca de Juárez, Mexico. Refusal of a Request for Permission to Build a Fast-Food Restaurant in a Historic Cultural Centre .....	199
9.	Demolition of a Historic House in the Flores District .....	206
10.	Provincial Superior Court of Justice (STJ) Judgements .....	207
	Theme Three: Implementing Environmental Law .....	211
	Chapter VIII: Voluntary Implementation .....	211
I.	Introduction .....	212
II.	Implementation Theory .....	212

- 1. Voluntary Compliance ..... 212
- 2. Enforcement ..... 213
- 3. Deterrence ..... 214
- III. The Problem of Inefficacy ..... 214
  - 1. Declaratory Legislation ..... 215
  - 2. Collective Goods..... 216
- IV. Voluntary Compliance ..... 217
  - 1. Institutional Context: Confidence and Transaction Costs ..... 217
  - 2. Building Social Capital ..... 219
  - 3. Principles of Good Governance..... 220
  - 4. Market Regulation ..... 220
- V. Compliance Programmes..... 221
  - 1. Establishment of Intermediate and Final Objectives ..... 222
  - 2. “Command-Control” Techniques..... 222
  - 3. Cultural Incentives..... 223
  - 4. Measuring Success..... 223
  - 5. Identification of Subjects Mandated by the Regulation ..... 223
  - 6. Identification of Complementary Roles..... 223
  - 7. Compliance Monitoring by a Clearly Identified Authority ..... 224
  - 8. Precise Definition of Powers for Applying Penalties..... 225
- VI. Conclusion..... 225
- Chapter IX: The Civil Liability System for Environmental Damage ..... 227
  - I. Introduction..... 227
    - 1. New Frontiers in Civil Liability..... 228
    - 2. Multifunctionality of the System..... 229
  - II. Preventive Function ..... 231
    - 1. General Duty to Prevent Damage ..... 231
    - 2. Preventive Action ..... 232

III. Remedial Function.....	235
1. Restoration. Remedying Environmental Damage.....	235
2. Quantification of Collective Environmental Damage .....	236
IV. Punitive Function or Dissuasive Pecuniary Penalty .....	239
1. Purpose and Objectives of the Concept .....	239
2. Assumptions and Admissibility Requirements.....	241
V. Precautionary Function .....	243
1. Bases.....	243
2. Effects on the General Civil Liability System .....	245
Chapter X: Civil Liability Assumptions .....	247
I. Introduction.....	247
II. Damage .....	248
1. Concept and Type.....	248
2. Specific Characteristics of Environmental Damage..	250
III. Unlawfulness.....	251
1. Expanding the Boundaries of Unlawfulness.....	251
2. Restrictive Interpretation of Justification.....	254
IV. Causal Link .....	257
1. Notion and Specificities.....	257
2. Proving a Causal Link .....	260
V. Attribution Factors.....	262
1. Concept and Specificities .....	262
2. Restrictive Interpretation of Exemptions .....	263
3. Cases of Joint and Several Liability .....	265
VI. State Civil Liability for Environmental Damage .....	267
Chapter XI: Environmental Class Actions.....	275
I. Conflict and Proceedings .....	275
II. Polycentric Proceedings.....	276
III. Legal Standing .....	279
1. The Notion of “Affected Party” .....	279
2. Public Legal Standing: The Ombudsman and Prosecutors.....	282

3. Civil Society: Associations.....	283
4. The Notion of Collective Good in Relation to Legal Standing and Competence .....	284
Chapter XII: The Judgement .....	289
Part One—Characteristics of the Collective Judgement .....	289
I. The Judgement on Individual Homogeneous Interests ..	291
1. Expansive Effects of the Judgement .....	291
a) Judgement in favour of the claim .....	292
b) Judgement rejecting the claim.....	292
c) Judgement rejecting the claim due to lack of evidence.....	292
d) Res judicata in environmental matters .....	292
2. Multiple Proceedings and Lis Pendens .....	293
II. The Judgement on Collective Goods .....	296
Part Two—Atypical Judgements .....	296
I. Distinction Between a Declaratory Judgement and an Enforced Judgement.....	296
1. Declaratory Judgement.....	297
2. Enforced Judgement.....	298
II. Exhortations.....	298
III. Interim Mandatory Injunction and Interim Prohibitory Injunction .....	299
IV. Mandates Directed at Government .....	300
1. Mandate Oriented Towards a Substantive Result.....	301
2. Mandate Oriented Towards the Mode of Implementation.....	301
V. Mandates Directed at Congress.....	302
VI. Issues With Implementing Atypical Judgements .....	302
1. The Issue of Time in Implementation .....	302
2. Implementation Guarantees. Creation of a Micro- Institutionality .....	305
3. Orders Organising Implementation .....	306
Part Three—The Constitutional Problem.....	307

Appendix: Relevant Judgements In Comparative Law .....	309
Brazil .....	309
India .....	316
Netherlands .....	322
United Kingdom .....	326
Canada .....	327
Pakistan .....	328
Inter-American Court of Human Rights .....	329
Kenya .....	334
Thailand .....	334
Austria .....	335
Colombia .....	336
Germany .....	348
Portugal .....	349
Philippines .....	350
Belgium .....	351
Switzerland .....	353
New Zealand .....	354
Costa Rica .....	355
Jamaica .....	359
El Salvador .....	360
Mexico .....	363
Panama .....	369
Peru .....	373
China .....	389
United States .....	392
Argentina .....	396